

PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology

THE DYNASTIC ELITIST POLITICAL PARTIES IN PAKISTAN: AN ANALYSIS OF THE PML (N) AND PPP MANIFESTOS

Dr. Muqarrab Akbar¹, Sara Ahmad², Mahnoor Malik³, Dr. Muhammad Javeed Akhtar⁴

^{1,3}Department of Political Science, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan.

²Department of Politics and International Relations, Lahore Leads University, Lahore,
Pakistan.

⁴Department of Pakistan Studies, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan.

Correspondence Author Email: [1muqarrabakbar@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:muqarrabakbar@bzu.edu.pk)

Email: [2saraahmad5161@gmail.com](mailto:saraahmad5161@gmail.com), [3mahnoormalik2021@hotmail.com](mailto:mahnoormalik2021@hotmail.com)

[4javidsalyana@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:javidsalyana@bzu.edu.pk)

**Dr. Muqarrab Akbar, Sara Ahmad, Mahnoor Malik, Dr. Muhammad Javeed Akhtar.
The Dynastic Elitist Political Parties in Pakistan: An Analysis of The Pml (N) And Ppp
Manifestos -- Palarch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology 19(3), 849-858.
ISSN 1567-214x**

Keywords: Dynastic, Elite, Politics, Manifesto, Parties

ABSTRACT

Political elite existed in almost every society that holds political power, governs over the country, have has a stronghold over the economy, public office and power. In Pakistan, dynastic political parties exist and the leadership of most of the parties is heredity. The dynasties in Pakistan mostly are of feudal origin and their politics revolve around to strengthening their family interest. The current study focuses on the nature of dynastic political elitist parties in Pakistan particularly analysing the manifesto of the elitist political parties. The target political parties for the analysis of this research are Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PMLN).

INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon of dynastic politics is not new in Pakistan because two major ruling political parties, Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PMLN), qualify as dynastic elites. Mostly, in third world countries like India, Pakistan, Philippines, Indonesia, Thailand and Singapore, dynastic elites are found (Purdey, 2016). In these developing countries, the tradition of dynastic politics has emerged from the beginning. The non-

dynastic elites face more challenges as compared to dynastic elites such as financial issues, establishing credibility in political spheres, managing the vote bank and attracting voters. In the politics of Pakistan, people are not willing to elect new faces and cast their votes just to show their loyalty to those political parties and families who have already ruled over the country which encourages a dynastic political system (Akhtar & Mushtaq, 2014). People do not want to take any risk and elect the same candidates every time. The dynastic political parties make sure that people trust them and show their attachment through their behaviour and votes (Feinstein, 2010).

Due to well-established dynastic elites in Pakistan, the emerging political leadership and political parties in Pakistan, face less acceptance by the public. The connection between the dynastic political elites and election campaigns in Pakistan is of crucial importance in this regard. The study suggests that dynastic political elites are a risk to the democratic system of Pakistan. This study provides a foundation for emerging parties for designing their party manifesto that dynastic political elites use to make their election campaigns successful. The objective of this study is to focus on the single factor for understanding the behaviour of the political elite through the party manifesto.

The dynastic political elite has a powerful impact on the political system because the people of Pakistan cast their votes due to their affiliation with the power of political families. Essentially, the party affiliation is based on the family voting trends, emotional attachment, biradari system and so forth. The parties usually make voting calls in the name of their senior political leaders, their sacrifices and their development tasks and so forth. It shows that the political dynastic leaders impact the behaviour of the masses. This research discusses the emergence of the dynastic political elite, political parties in Pakistan and their manifestos.

The Concept of “Elite”

“Elite” is the term of the English, it is restructured to the French word, but it also has roots in the Latin word “eligere”. The superior, top, exceed people denote the term “Elite”. In the system of politics, the followers of elites protected a large part in political offices of the Mosca (2012), Pareto (1942) view. The leading class of society of all the offices is shared by men fitting in the Marxian and his follower's view. The brand name identification is beneficial for the people who are the dynastic elites in the politics, they did not use their financial resources as much as the non-dynastic elites used, and dynastic elites get the votes only on the name of the party. They get their votes only on the popularity of the party name. They also get an advantage in the election campaign; most of the people come to their rallies due to the party affiliation of that member. They emphasise the dynastic elites of theorisation, features of their occurrence or their employment (Sharma & Sharma, 2007). It similarly gives importance to Pakistan's dynastic elites and their jobs.

The term political elite is used anonymously which refers to the “power”, it means the powerful members of the government who make a meaningful choices on the decision on the different matters (Beck & Mckechnie, 2003).

Governing elite, power elite or ruling elite all are labeled as the elite in a political sphere. Elites of specialised, elites of social and elites of governing are classes by the Nadel (1956). By Shils (1960), there are five groups, i.e. democracies of political, democracies of tutelary, oligarchies of modernising, oligarchies of totalitarian, oligarchies of traditional in the Non-Western political system. Few People's government is known as an oligarchy. Oligarchy is the term that is also used in the context of the dynastic political elites. Oligarchy expensed their power to continue their authority to influence others by their wealth.

To give someone favouritism not because of good work is done by that person, but because of the peripheral membership. Denoting the biasness of the associates or the friends is known as Cronyism which precise the method of favouritism. Nepotism is the Italian word which is nephew. It shelters the family members due to the b. Cronyism and nepotism are frequently used for public office when the political parties recruit the candidates. These terms are also employed in the form of the dynastic political elites because the people of the dynastic families used their brand name for the election campaign and tried to fill site in the name of favouritism (Nadler & Schulman, 2015).

The term "Elite" in Pakistan

In the context of Pakistan, the term governing elite also explain different types of elites such as governing elites, political elites or decision-maker. Praeto (1963) and Mosca (1939) outspread the notion of the elite strengthening in every society, the people of the minority who take the major decisions on the behalf of the other population of the country. All societies have two kinds of classes one that is ruled over the country and the other one is the ruling class (Fatima, 2014).

People are also distributed into two sessions (class) such as above or elite or the ruling class and lower class or ruled class in which the upper-class rules. They also explain the concept of the elites, according to them, the set of the specific people who have the special quality that why they are reserved in the society. These qualities may be political, economic, social, military and so forth (Azeez & Ibukunoluwa, 2015).

Types of Elites

According to Menges (1968), "in society, a high position held by the elite is a descriptive term." There are two types of the elites such as governing elites (directly or indirectly taking part in the consecutively the government) and non-governing elites (influence the major discussion of government through different means). In Southeast Asia, the comparison of the various countries such as the Philippines, Thailand, Indonesia, Singapore take as an example of the former and current leaders of the dynastic elites. He also shows how the political power transfers from one member to the other member of the same family so the new members cannot enjoy the power (Purdey, 2016).

The dynastic elites come to the local as well as the national level. In the contemporary politics, the contrast of the family, patronage and dynasty has an emphasis in the Philippines, Thailand, Singapore and Indonesia. The transfer of wealth and power from one generation to the next in the same family by variability of the political system is stated as a political dynasty (McCoy, 2009).

A study on Pakistani voters' behaviour in the elections, factors in which voters gave the votes to the parties, i.e. the language, caste, religion and so forth. In Pakistan, the main objective of democracy is representing opinion of the public in the democratic regime. The democratic regime is successful through the interaction with the people of the state and according to their desire, the government should be formed.

The ideology of the party, the leadership of the party, the manifesto of the party, the staff for campaign and the political workers all are different factors which are necessary for the electoral campaign (Trent & Friedenber, 2011). On the other hand, the entire social factors such as the money, language, caste system, religion and so forth are important for the electoral campaign. For the success of the candidate, it is important to compete in the elections through the electoral campaign (Saldanha, 2018).

Dynastic Elites in Pakistan's Politics

In 1965 Pakistan has gone through indirect elections and in 1970, the first general elections were held. In 1951 provincial election in erstwhile NWFP and Punjab; in 1953 in Sindh and in 1954 in Bengal. The constituent assembly was elected indirectly by the provincial assemblies' members. After making the first constitution of Pakistan in 1956, the date for the first election was declared. In 1958 martial law was enforced by Ayub Khan (Akhtar, Awan & Haq, 2010).

From 1977 to 1988 Zia ul Haq imposed martial law in the country. In 1988-90 and 1993-96, the chairperson of PPP Benazir Bhutto was elected as a prime minister two times as well as Nawaz Sharif the leader of PML (N) was elected as a prime minister two times from 1990-93 and 1996-99. On October 12 1999, President General Pervez Musharraf peaceful coup by discharging Nawaz Sharif government. The late Benazir Bhutto, Chairperson of PPP and Asif Ali Zardari her spouse followed the case of the corruption by Pervez Musharraf and also put the Sharif brothers behind the bars (Talbot, 2010).

Pakistan is a developing country with a developing system of politics with several obstacles in the development of the political system. In the democratic and authoritarian systems, the political parties play a major role. The main non-political actors are the army, Ulema, bureaucracy, biradaries and so forth. To fill the gap in the dictatorial system only a single party system or one party was assumed by the political leaders and the authority to legitimise on the other hand the political parties are shaped by elites of politics in the campaign for the elections to win (Ahmed, 2009).

Due to the major biradarries (Jatts, Rajputs and Arians) of Punjab Unionists were the most popular than the Muslim League in Punjab. In the 1937 elections, the Unionist party won the elections by biradarries. In the 1946 elections, in Punjab due to the support of the biradarries Muslim League also won. In the 1950s, the role of the army started in politics. Biradari politics is an inherited gift of the pre-partition period, and the bureaucracy is involved (Talbot, 2010).

Another factor that assisted dynastic elites in Pakistan is the charisma of the leader. Weber (1947) was the first scholar who describes the charismatic leadership. Three categories of the power as the procedure of governor that people will admit, i.e. charismatic, traditional and legal/rationale by Max Weber. "Collection from a normal individual which is preserved as a gifted by the mystic, brilliant or qualities with exceptional powers and these are the centre point on which the people preserved as a leader" the Max Weber defines the charisma (Weber, 1947).

Socialized charismatic leadership is known as the first type of members, which is famous to exercise to interactive to the supporters to get the attentions, to connect the followers is the talent to express and collaborators the things is the one quality but also have a capacity to engage and listen the supporters to attain the mutual visualization (Blackshear, 2003).

Personalized charisma is one more type of charismatic leadership. Personalized charismatic leaders are different in that they themselves or others consider them the only owner of expertises, talent and direction. The leaders in the personalized charismatic established by their individual achievement, they did not think about the collective advantage (Pree, 1992). A leader of the personalized charismatic chooses a top-down (one-way) and is frequently concerned of obtaining authority in their advantage inspired by the group. Avolio and Gardner (2005) explained the third type of the charismatic leader, the leadership is followed by the method in which the perform drive over for the great leader. The dramaturgical charismatic leader is an individual who cultivates his charisma or constructs connections to the supporters of the performer to the viewers (Bennis, 2000). The leaders in this charismatic are to practice the abilities, connections and choices which seems real for every time. They are the main character and the world as a stage in their vision. In practices, they are both, i.e. personalised or socialized.

In Pakistan, the leaders have all the qualities of the charismatic leaders who were clear about the vision of creating a separate homeland for the Muslims. He was always willing for taking risk at international or national forums. A charismatic leader must have the quality to gather people to listen to him or her. Due to his personality and charm, he has so many followers. He has innovative ideas to influence the people or the supporters. He was always communicating with his followers to know the perspective of his followers. He can convince his supporters to a new change. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto can be seen as an example of charisma (Khan & Rahman, 2018; Quddus, 2020).

DOCUMENTARY ANALYSIS

This study is based on the documentary analysis of the dynastic political parties elites. The documents selected for the analysis are the manifesto of the major political dynastic parties of Pakistan i.e. PPP and PML(N) from the time of their emergence.

FINDINGS OF THE DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

Manifesto of PPP

The first manifesto of PPP was for 1970 and 1977; the manifesto was based on Islam, with faith being the main policy of the party along with democracy. The rise of neo-colonialism and the promise was made to give equality to all without any discrimination. The primary aims of the party included: the betterment of Pakistan by achieving good governance and overcoming the obstacles; without any interference from the capitalist establishment of the system; strengthening the agricultural department; focusing on animal husbandry and resolving the social problems. In the manifesto, the main objective was to improve the economy in all the ways and means. Due to the system errors stop the misuse of the people's rights who have awareness and aptitude, give equal rights to all by removal of class differences, giving rights to the workers, strengthen the local self- Government, provide minorities' rights, establish the Administrative courts and Ombudsmen, encourage jail reforms, abolition of "Jirga" system. Abolition of honors and princely state, strengthen the foreign policy, with great powers develop good relations and improve the financial measures by establishing right nationalization policy, the establishment of the investment policy, improving taxation system, employing the system of wasteful expenditure of national wealth.

The manifesto also gave the guidelines for education reforms as primary and secondary schools, higher education, freedom of conscience, freedom of thought and freedom of expression. National health included saving one's own and family life and defending against the violence of the foreign.

The next manifesto was introduced in 1988 which was initiated in the era of dictatorship. Pakistan's main focus was on democratic governance not on the military by means of peace and humanity. The main aim of the PPP party was to support the notion of Islam that contains: justice, harmony, egalitarianism, and autonomy, unite the nation and try to bring all the people of the country under one national umbrella. Without any discrimination on the basis of race, gender, age, religion, and gave equal social and human rights to all the citizens. Moreover, provide equal opportunities to all, freedom as well as the protection for all to practice their culture and norms, maintain the political stability and civil rights and create opportunities for better human resources, and potential opportunities should be maximised. All the regions' participation should be ensured in Senate along with a solid defence system. Party should be ready to revise all the orders in the 21st century; the main aim was to achieve the effective governance by the revolution of the modern ideas including elimination of poverty, equal supply to all capitals and chances makes the prosperity, feudal system stop, literacy rate increase, guarantee

every child's education, equal and fair taxation system, revolutionize the banking, strengthening and modernizing the agricultural technologies, taking initiatives for science and technological growth. The main objective of the 1988 manifesto was to safeguard the territory, and strengthen all the departments and affairs of the country.

The manifesto of 1993 was based on public and private partnerships. The main objective of this manifesto was that the country was recognized through the core principles of faith, quid, unity and discipline. The country's honesty will be reestablished in the field of economy and politics. Both the sectors public and private will be established in the country. The new social contract will be the main philosophy in the 21st century. Islam should be used in the core philosophy, of freedom; giving rise to fascism and giving equal rights to minorities and eliminating religious judgments. Strengthening the politics of pluralism is one of the reforms. 18-21 years is the voting age (PPP Manifesto, 1993).

The manifesto of 2008 is recognized by the people of Pakistan who are blessed, but the attention was given to the children. The main promise of the PPP was made in the manifesto was to make Pakistan free from violence, racism, terror and also providing equal opportunities to all such as health, employment, education and facilities. The main thing which was focused on the party was to eliminate evils such as extremism, anarchy, hungry, poverty, and commotion. The main aims and objectives which party believe to be done such as people's facility with education, employment, energy environment and equality (PPP Manifesto, 2008).

The mission of the party was defined by the party as the transformation of the lives of our people from one of misery and poverty into one of hope and opportunity through employment, education, energy, environment and equality. The strategic plan was the protection of the rights of workers. The party also believed in the freedom of opinion. The focus was also on securing the country's culture, environment, local election policies, rights of the females and minorities. The party gave the reformation and autonomy to the local governments, and all the local government followed the party's devolution, civil service reforms, as well as the police reforms, will be focused. Party also aims to develop Pakistan up to the global standards by all means; also focused on developing better relations with the neighbouring countries and also strengthening the system of defence.

In the 2013 manifesto of PPP, the party has mainly focused on overwhelming issues of homelessness, deprivation of food, unavailability of health care services, lack of education, and unavailability of equal opportunities by providing the basic human rights of the people. The party also aimed to protect the rights of the people on the priority bases especially the working class, special programmes were initiated by the party such as Benazir income support, the lady, health workers program. The core belief of the party is that it is the responsibility of the party to provide the basic needs of food and shelter to every individual in the country. The special focus was to provide the enrollment of the children in education through the primary school from the

age of 5 to 12 years because they considered education an ultimate right of every individual. According to the 18th amendment, education was acknowledged as a vital part of the individual. Education should be given to all without any perception of gender, race and cast. Party also gives importance to the health sector by giving free medical treatment to the people of the country. Party also believed that farmers and workers are the backbones of the progress of the country. So the party facilitates them with the basic rights of life such as food and shelter (PPP Manifesto, 2013).

Manifesto of PML (N)

The next party PML (N), in the 2013 manifesto the main thing was to follow the guidance of founding father, Jinnah's vision. The main vision was to remove the fears of the people towards liberty, fraternity and equality and also develop the democratic political culture in the country. PML (N) believed in policies and the promotion of the rights of the female population. Basic seven strategies plans of PML (N) as denoted to extremism to be combat, education for all, energy better management, employment for youth, empowerment of women, economic revival, and elimination of corruption.

PML (N) promised to strengthen democratic values by increasing human rights, developed and supporting the enterprise culture by giving support to skilled persons. PML (N) gave importance to education for the entire individual of the country without any discrimination of the facilitation of all the people. After the 18th amendment, the main objectives which PML (N) defined were free schooling, the establishment of training institutions, improvement of teacher education, and the establishment of public and district libraries, making the higher education commission fully autonomous, and strengthening the whole educational system and religious madrasas as well. Party's main focus was to increase the Gross Domestic production rate by enhancing the public sectors thus removing poverty (PML Manifesto, 2013).

CONCLUSION

In this study, the researcher selected two main political parties, i.e. PPP and PMLN, in which there is already an existence of the dynastic elites and also seems as an emergence of new dynastic political elites. The party PPP was formed by Z.A. Bhutto, and after his assassination, the power was transferred to his daughter (Benazir Bhutto). The people of Pakistan voted for her (Benazir Bhutto) on the call of her daughter as 'Bhutto kal bhi zinda tha, Bhutto aj bhi zinda hai (Bhutto is alive yesterday and also today). The people cast vote only in the name of Bhutto and after the death of Benazir Bhutto people and their hopes again got scattered, but then Benazir Bhutto's son Bilawal Bhutto gets ready to cash the charisma in the name of his mother and grandfather. In PPP, the clear cuts of the dynastic political elites are seen.

On the other side, the dynastic political elite PML (N), then the party emerged by the separation of PML and the people of the country start supporting the PML (N) in the name of Sharif. In this party, the dynastic elite is also seen as the Sharif brothers (Nawaz Sharif, Shabaz Sharif) the whole party is linked with these people. At present Hamza Sharif and Maryam Sharif are active in

political activities, and it is expected to see them in the upcoming election as they have come as candidates.

People are not well aware of all the manifesto reforms. They just focus on the slogans of parties such as Roti, Kapda, Makan for PPP and infrastructure development for the PMLN. Political socialisation has a significant influence on voting trends. People are psychologically attached to both the elite dynastic parties, i.e. PPP and PML (N). In the era of 2002, there was martial law in the country and both the supporters of PPP and PML (N) supported each other.

In both the dynastic political elites, a new party emerged which is challenged by the existing elite system. The trend changed in 2013. People voted for PTI because they wanted to change. The supporters of PPP and PML (N) are not willing to vote in 2018 for these parties and their future offspring. However, at the same time, half of the respondents agree to vote for these parties, and some would now vote only for the performance of the parties.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, M. (2009). Relationship between Political Parties and Non-Political Powers: An Analysis concerning Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 29(1), 107-115.
- Akhtar, M. J., & Awan, S. M. (2010). Elections of Pakistan and Response of Social Scientists: A Study of Theoretical Understandings. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 30(2), 453-466.
- Akhtar, N., & Mushtaq, S. (2014). The dynastic elites and its recruitment in political process of Pakistan. *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(1), 1-18.
- Avolio, B. J., & Gardner, W. L. (2005). Authentic leadership development: Getting to the root of positive forms of leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 315 – 338.
- Azeez, A., & Ibukunoluwa, A. (2015). Elite Theory and Elite Circulation in Nigerian Politics. *International journal of Banking, Finance, Management & Development Studies*, 3(1), 1-11.
- Bennis, W. G. (2000). *Managing the dream: Reflections on leadership and change.* , MA: . Cambridge: Perseus Books.
- Blackshear, P. B. (2003). The Followership Continuum: A Model for Increasing Organizational Productivity. *The Public Sector Innovation Journal*, 9(1), 1-14.
- Beck, C., & Mckechnie, J. T. (2003). *Political Elites: A Select Computerized Bibliography.* London: MIT Press.
- Fatima, Q. (2014). Who Governs Pakistan? *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences*, 4.
- Feinstein, B. D. (2010). The Dynasty Advantage: Family Ties in Congressional Elections. *Legislative Studies Quarterly*, 571-598.
- Khan, N. U., & Rahman, A. U. (2018). National Character and Leadership in Pakistan: Challenges and Response. *Pakistan Journal of Criminology*, 10(2), 57-71.
- McCoy, A. W. (2009). *An Anarchy of Families State and Family in the Philippines.* Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

- Menges, C. (1968). *Ruling Elite Theories and Research Methods: An Evaluation*. RAND Corporation.
- Mosca, G. (2012). *The Ruling Class*. New York: Ulan Press.
- Nadel, S. F. (1956). *International social science bulletin* (Vol. 3). UNESCO.
- Pareto, V. (1942). *The Mind and Society: A treatise on general sociology*. California: Harcourt, Brace and Co.
- Pree, M. D. (1992). *Leadership Jazz*. New York: Doubleday Business.
- PPP Manifesto. (2008). *Pakistan People's Party Parliamentarian*. Retrieved from <http://www.pppusa.org/upload/manifesto2008.pdf>
- PML N Manifesto. (2013). *Pakistan People's Party Parliamentarian*. Retrieved from <http://www.pppusa.org/upload/manifesto2008.pdf>
- PPP Manifesto. (2013). *Pakistan People's Party Parliamentarian*. Retrieved from https://www.cpdi-pakistan.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/PPP_Manifesto_2013.pdf
- Purdey, J. (2016). Political families in Southeast Asia. *South East Asia Research*, 24(3), 319-327.
- Quddus, S. A. (2020). *Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: Politics of Charisma*. Retrieved from <https://bhutto.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/Zulfikar-Ali-Bhutto-Politics-of-Charisma-Selection-of-Articles.pdf>
- Sharma, U., & Sharma, S. K. (2007). *Principles and Theory of Political Science* (Vol. II). New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers & Distributors.
- Saldanha, A. (2018). How caste and religion influence selection of political leaders in India. *Business Standard*. Retrieved from https://www.business-standard.com/article/politics/how-caste-and-religion-influence-selection-of-political-leaders-in-india-118071800122_1.html
- Shils, E. (1960). Political Development in the New States. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 265-292.
- Talbot, I. (2010). *Pakistan: A Modern History*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Trent, J., & Friedenberg, R. (2011). *Political campaign communication: Principles and practices*. Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Weber, M. (1947). *The theory of social and economic organization*. New York: Free Press.