PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology

MAPPING AND IDENTIFYING HALAL PRODUCTS OF MICRO, SMALL, AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES (MSMEs) IN TERNATE CITY, INDONESIA

Abdul Hadi Sirat¹, Hartaty Hadady², Mochammad Apriyadi Hadi Sirat³, Jaharuddin bin Padli⁴

^{1,2,3}Universitas Khaerun Ternate, Indonesia ⁴Universiti Malaysia Terengganu

Email: ¹abdul_hadisirat@yahoo.com ²hartaty.hadady.unkhair.ac.id
³apriyadisirat@unkhair.ac.id ⁴jaharudin@umt.edu.my

Abdul Hadi Sirat, Hartaty Hadady, Mochammad Apriyadi Hadi Sirat, Jaharuddin bin Padli. MAPPING AND IDENTIFYING HALAL PRODUCTS OF MICRO, SMALL, AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES (MSMEs) IN TERNATE CITY, INDONESIA-Palarch's Journal Of Archaeology Of Egypt/Egyptology 17(4), 3294-3305. ISSN 1567-214x

(Keywords are not available)

ABSTRACT

Halal products produced by SMEs in Indonesia have been guaranteed with the birth of Law Number 33 of 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee (UUJPH). This study aims to determine and analyze the Mapping and Identification of Halal Products for MSMEs in Ternate City. This research is a case study with a qualitative approach. Data collection methods include interviews and documentation, while the data analysis technique used is descriptive analysis. The results of this study found that MSMEs who registered and received halal label certificates were still relatively small compared to the number of MSMEs in Ternate City. Halal products produced by SMEs in Ternate City are very diverse in number, especially in food and beverage products

INTRODUCTION

Awareness of the Muslim community about the food consumed is increasing, thus the demand for halal food has also increased. Also, the Muslim population in the world today is increasing to reach a quarter of the total world population and is expected to reach 30% in 2025 (Roberts, 2010). This condition encourages many countries to start developing a new paradigm that concern on halal products, halal treat, and sharia system. Therefore, halal-certified products have a huge market opportunity in the coming future. According to the current analysis of Reports and Data by Globalnewswire, the

global Halal Ingredients market was valued at USD 46.8 Billion in 2019 and expected to reach USD 66.9 Billion by the year 2026, at a CAGR of 6.2%. The number of Muslims also continues to grow along with the increasing population. The current population of Indonesia is 274,779,789 as of Monday, December 7, 2020, based on Worldometer elaboration of the latest United Nations data. The majority of Indonesia's population is Muslim. Accordingly, Indonesia has the potential to increase the growth of the halal food industry.

A survey conducted in 76 countries consists of 57 OIC countries and 16 non-OIC countries show a great contribution to the financial sector and halal food industry compared to other sectors. The potential revenue is predicted to reach \$1.9 trillion in 2021, and the halal food industry becomes the primary attention in various countries, including Malaysia. For three consecutive years, Malaysia has become the first halal food producer. Thailand is also starting to develop their halal food industry even though Thailand is not a predominantly Muslim country, this because the halal food industry has good prospects in the future. According to the 2016/2017 *State of The Global Islamic Economy* report published by Thomson Reuters, Indonesia was the first place for consumers of halal food products, which value around \$154.9 billion. However, the Indonesian government has not been able to maximize the market which shown that Indonesia was ranked 10th in the category of halal food producers.

In connection with the discourse above, the government through various ministries and related agencies is trying to encourage MSMEs to give more attention in this halal industries for instance to find out the efforts made, as well as the obstacles encountered in pushing halal certification of the MSMEs.

Based on the BPS data in 2019, there are around 59 million Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in Indonesia and those who already have the certificates are still very few approximately 6,500 companies and MSMEs based on data from the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) as the authorized institution for the issuance of halal certificates. As for overseas companies, MUI has issued halal certificates for more or less 700 companies. This means that there are still millions of MSMEs that have not implemented halal certification for their products. Therefore, the government must push further and maximize the issuance of halal certificates for MSMEs in purpose to increase the revenue of the halal industry in Indonesia, especially from the halal food sector.

Plenty of unlabeled halal products are very unsettling to society because the halal label of a product is highly considered by the public as consumers to buy things that will be used. Law Number 33 the year 2014 concerns on the Guarantee of Halal Product, Article 33 paragraph (1) explains that the issuance of halal product is carried out by the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI). There are three dimensions in the development of the halal industry and Islamic bank plays a role to maximize these three things, as follow:

- Micro and small enterprises shall give greater opportunities to built and develop halal products.
- The halal industry must be promoted to build awareness about the importance of using halal service products.
- Halal lifestyle should be developed further and comprehensive.

The development of the halal industry sector cannot be carried out without the cooperation of various parties. Accordingly, it is necessary to integrate the role of parties such as government and Islamic financial institutions to improve the competitiveness of MSMEs in the halal food industry. This sector plays a significant role in the Indonesian economy because 99.99% are MSMEs out of the entire business structure in Indonesia or as many as 56.54 million units. And their hardiness has been tested through the crisis. Unfortunately related to halal issues, it is assumed that MSMEs are not yet efficient both in the use of raw materials, energy, and the use of other supporting materials.

A halal label on a product is an important phenomenon that not only marks the rise of awareness of ethical and spiritual values in the realm of business and producer business behavior but also shows the producers' concern for the benefit of consumers. This phenomenon is a trending issue globally and not only in Muslim majority countries which includes not only food products but also products that are used or utilized. Thus, it will gain a positive impact and arouse the halal industry movement in every aspect of life. This halal industry has become a necessity and plays a role in advancing the economy continuously.

Bohari, Cheng, & Fuad (2013) examined the quality standards of products in accordance with Islamic Shariah law which uses in daily activities and found that halal products and services were chosen by Muslims as a form of observance to God. Although halal is closely related to Muslims, it does not mean consumers of halal products come from the Muslims community only. The motivation of this study lays on the huge potential of the halal industry in Indonesia. However, there are no concrete actions that have been realized to optimizing the role of various related parties. The development of the halal industry will be more competitive with the involvement of the Islamic financial and banking industry sector. The development of the halal industry must go hand in hand with its financial planning.

Research Problem

Based on the interview results with the Department of Industry and owners of MSMEs with the existing halal label in Ternate City, this study formulates problem to be emphasized as follow:

- How to identify and map the MSMEs whose products have been labeled halal by the MUI di Ternate city?
- What are the challenges factors in identifying and mapping the MSMEs whose products have been labeled halal by the MUI di Ternate City?
- What are the prospects for developing halal products in Ternate City?

The study purposes based on the description of the problem formulation above aims to identify and analyze the map of halal entrepreneurs in Ternate City. As well as identifying and analyzing the obstacles to map the halal entrepreneurs in Ternate City.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research Types and Approach

This study uses a qualitative descriptive approach, one of the types under qualitative research methods. Bogdan, et.all (2016) suggest that qualitative methodology is a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of written or oral words from people and observable behavior. Thus, qualitative research is a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of written or oral words whose implementation occurs naturally. As the purpose of this type of research is to uncover the facts, circumstances, and phenomena that occur, this research is expected to be able to identify and map MSME entrepreneurs in Ternate City. Furthermore, the type of research used is a case study that is a micro-business product that already has a halal label.

Data Collection

The data source in this study is divided into two, primary and secondary data. Primary data obtained from a direct source through interviews with enterprises especially micro-enterprises. Secondary data is gathered from several sources for instance MSMEs data who already has or does not have a halal certificate. accordingly, this paper employs three instruments in the data collection, as follow:

- Observation on the object of research; Considering that this research is a qualitative study, the research object is a social situation that consists of three components, namely place, people, and activity.
- Interview; This study conducted a semi-structured interview because this method allows us to obtain more data than expected. This semi-structured interview was conducted to find out how to identify and map the utilization of halal products in purpose to attract consumers.
- Documentation; Interview sheets, cameras, and recording devices are used to record during the interview and the results will be used as evidence in the process of reporting research results.

Data Analysis

In this study, data were analyzed using descriptive analysis method. The obtained data are compiled then interpreted and analyzed to provide information to answer the research problem.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

MSMEs and Halal certificate

In Ternate, there are two groups of entrepreneurs, enterprises that already have the halal certificate and those who do not have yet. Three main targets to be achieved with the halal certificate are as follows: first, a benefit to consumers by providing protection and legal certainty; second, benefit to a producer by increasing competitiveness and profit; and third, benefit to the government by generating additional revenue for the State treasury.

Micro entrepreneurs who already have halal certificates are far away lesser compared to the total number of enterprises in Ternate, which is 34 business operators out of 300 MSMEs. This condition is very worrying because the number of micro-entrepreneurs is greater than the medium-sized enterprises. Consequently, the number of available products in the market with guaranteed halal quality is very small compared to the number of products that are not guaranteed halal. Although entrepreneurs in Ternate have the commitment and willingness to produce halal products and they already know about halal certification too. But in reality, the majority of entrepreneurs have not issued halal certificates for their products by the authorized institutions. Insufficient knowledge about the procedures of halal certification from LPPOM MUI is the main issue for this problem besides the cost as well.

Almost all enterprises in Ternate understand the importance of halal certificates on their products because most of the entrepreneurs are Moslem. But apparently, there are still some entrepreneurs who do not know about the halal certification process. The obligation of halal certification for all products has been enforced in 2019 in line with the enactment of Law no. 33 of 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee. The understanding of entrepreneurs in Ternate region about halal certification is relatively low. The market share of food products in Jatinangor is not in line with the availability of food with labeled halal which guarantees through halal certification. This condition is caused due to various reasons where the main reason is the lack of knowledge, information, and socialization about the halal certification process, including the costs that must be incurred to obtain halal certification.

In Asia, Purnomo (2015) found that Malaysia, Thailand, and Singapore were more expansive and offensive in developing the country's export markets, while Indonesia tended to be defensive. Therefore, the research suggests that Home Industry products (IRT) that have received halal certification from MUI are encouraged to penetrate and compete in the open market. Purnama (2015) further pointed out the importance of understanding halal certification by micro-entrepreneurs, especially those engaged in the food processing business. The reasons are as follows: i) entrepreneurs have a socio-economic and socio-political strategic function for the people of Indonesia, ii) halal certification can guarantee the quality of products, iii) thus, the quality provides opportunities for entrepreneurs to penetrate international markets with their product. But unfortunately, even though Indonesia is the largest Muslim country in the world, understanding the importance of halal food and halal certification is still relatively low. The problem lies in the opinion of the people who consider it because Muslim citizens are the majority, therefore all

products traded by Muslims are halal even without the halal label. Consequently, the producers consider that there is no need to apply for halal certification to attract public trust. This is in line with the explanation by Huda (2012) which illustrates that halal regulation from the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) is not fully understood by the food vendors.

According to a survey, halal certification is very important for businesses because the presence of halal labels on their products will increase market share, especially products that can be exported to other Islamic countries. A halal certificate is an effort to improve the quality of a product. Besides to create additional values for businesses, the halal label becomes a necessity for consumers for consideration before buying a product. Moreover, halal certification protects consumers as well as convenience in consuming food not only for Muslim consumers but also for non-Muslims. This is also an added value for businesses to expand market segmentation. People choose a product not only by taste preference alone, but also to the quality of products such as hygiene, the composition of ingredients, expiration limits, and so forth. And for the Muslim community, it is very important to consider the halal matter before utilization.

The attachment of halal certification to a product is an important and mandatory issue that must be considered by all business actors. The Government through the Indonesian Food and Drug Administration and the Indonesian Ulema Council (LPPOM MUI) together with the Halal Product Guarantee Agency (BPJPH) have appealed all related parties to register for halal certification for every product to be traded in the community. Also, special funding or grants from the government, donors, and other parties need to be given to micro and small-medium enterprises such as Ternate so that they can immediately process the registration of halal certification which has been one of the main problems for them.

Obstacle Factor of Halal Product

Microentrepreneur faces several problems even though it contains specific advantages. The problems, in general, can be simplified into 2 categories, namely, the low ability to manage businesses due to the low quality of human resources and the limited access to productive resources. Moreover, the capability is a critical determining factor for achieving success in running a business, especially those related to marketing, capital, and technology. Also, there are two problems most often experienced by micro-enterprises, namely structural and cultural problems. Structural aspects such as access to capital, knowledge, and training about the market while cultural aspect is a way of thinking and mentality.

Some aspects related to marketing issues are the strict competition both in domestic and export markets. Meanwhile, in general, the quality of products and the productivity level of micro-enterprises especially in Ternate are difficult to compete, not to mention the non-conducive business climate that

causes high economic costs, such as expensive licensing with long procedures as well, and the weak competitiveness of products.

In addition to the problems faced above, micro-enterprises also face problems related to the halal certificate itself and the readiness level of enterprises in carrying out production activities and marketing for halal products. MUI halal certificate is a requirement for obtaining permission to put a halal label on product authorized government agencies. The purpose of the MUI halal certification is to provide certainty of halal status, thus giving consumers peace of mind in using the goods. The continuity of the halal production process is guaranteed by producers by implementing a Halal Guarantee System. The cost of halal certification and the lack of information regarding the terms and procedures of the halal certificate process are felt to be an additional burden for businesses because they will add to their expenses.

As stated in the halal product guarantee Act, the government shall facilitate and ease in the halal certification process. But in Indonesia, there are still many obstacles. One of them is the "tug-of-war" between the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) and the Ministry of Religion over who has the right to issue the halal certificate. For example, in Malaysia, the party that responsible for issuing halal certificates is given to the government so that all matters related to halal certification are centralized in one government institution. Besides, the problem that causes the small number of products or companies applied halal MUI certificates is due to the lack of acknowledgment about halal certification procedures. Moreover, the complexity of procedures and many documents must be prepared to cause entrepreneurs to discourage applying a halal certificate.

Basically, there are some obstacles faced by entrepreneurs when they want to register their products for halal certification. Those obstacles are as follows: First, the halal certification registration system is still manual in the past, thus many entrepreneurs feel hassle, but this is not an obstacle anymore because recently registration can be done online. The other problem that arises then is if the signal is not good or the website is experiencing interference for some areas, especially in the rural areas. Secondly, most entrepreneurs objected with the quite expensive cost of halal certification, while according to the LPPOM MUI the cost is relatively inexpensive. Thirdly, some enterprises think that halal certification is not yet urgent because even without it their products still have demands. Accordingly, the biggest obstacle is the awareness of entrepreneurs to consider the compulsory of the halal label on their products. [(see Sudarmiatin, Anam, and Wafaretta, (2020)]

To minimize these obstacles, LPPOM MUI and BPJPH must be able to guarantee comfort and certainty for entrepreneurs to submit applications for halal certification and also ensuring easiness for entrepreneurs who already obtained halal certification to extend the validity period. Moreover, cooperation between BPJPH as the provider halal certificates and MUI as an institution that issue halal fatwas has harmonious interaction and cooperation.

In summary, the strategies that need to be carried out are to conduct socialization related to the importance of having a halal label, and also the public must be given an understanding of the importance to consume products with the halal label.

The Prospective of Halal Product in Ternate

Ternate is a city in eastern Indonesia with a Muslim majority population. It is certainly an irony if the majority of products in the market are not guaranteed halal, and no party can ensure that raw materials or finished products that are traded have a halal label. Meanwhile, Muslims are highly required to consume halal products, start from raw materials, and the way it processed. The active role of the government as well as the positive response from the community in general on the development of the Islamic economy, including the halal product industry has its potential for entrepreneurs. But to what extent this potential be benefitted especially for the micro-enterprises in Ternate.

Socialization of Halal Certificate for Entrepreneurs in Ternate

The halal certification socialization activity to enterprises in Ternate was carried out in the form of visitation to introduce and provide an understanding of halal certification. This halal socialization activity begins with exploring the understanding and knowledge of entrepreneurs about their products, halal certification procedures, institutions involved in the issuing certificates. This aims to see the basic understanding of entrepreneurs towards halal certification, especially in terms of institutional and administrative matters. Then, the following activity is to explore entrepreneurs' understanding of halal labeling and their effects on sales. Is there any increase in sales due to increase consumer buying interest caused by a halal certificate on their products?

The interview results show that some benefits to being gained by the enterprises include the increasing consumer confidence on the available products in the market, the increasing competitiveness among similar products due to the presence of halal labels on the product, and the increasing of demand from Muslim buyers because there is a guarantee of halal issued by authorized institution thus dispel doubts of not halal products.

Entrepreneurs in Ternate are quite familiar with the concept of halal certification because they are Muslim in general. Ternate is a city of trade certainly makes the halal aspect of consumer products as an important factor. Unfortunately, this has not been accompanied by a proper understanding of the enterprises about the importance of halal certification itself. Most of them believe that the foods and beverages they sell are halal because they are Muslim and use ingredients that they consider to be categorized as halal substance. There are still a lot of micro-sized enterprises in Ternate that have not to apply halal certification for reasons of high-cost expense and lack of knowledge about the procedure to get halal certification.

This effort to socialize and collect data from the Maluku Province and Ternate City Ministry of Religion regarding halal certification is very much needed, given the large numbers of micro-sized enterprises compare to the medium-sized.

The need for Halal Products (goods and services)

One of the reasons for consuming halal products aside from the hygiene aspect is the fulfillment of Islamic law. Qardhawi (1999) defines the term halal as everything that can be done, the sharia allows it and those who do it are not subject to sanctions from Allah. Haram means everything or things that are prohibited by sharia (Islamic law), if somebody did it will cause sin, and if left behind will be rewarded. All activities are certainly based on this halal requirement, not only for food but also include in the field of work and other social lives. However, the issue of halal-haram in food consumption will have an impact on the physical and spiritual growth of a person and his family. In accordance with the hadith of the Messenger of Allah which states that "will not enter heaven a person whose flesh grows from (food) that is unclean, hell is more appropriate for him." (HR. Ahmad). There are three basic criteria in determining a dish that is allowed or prohibited to be consumed, namely halal, haram, and syubhat (in between). Halal means that it is permitted to be consumed, Haram is also clearly strictly forbidden to be consumed (except in emergency conditions), while syubhat is a condition where there is an unclear argument about halal-haram or because of differences of opinion among scholars in the jurisprudence of halal or haram. Beware (wara') and avoiding unclear food are preferable so as it does not fall into illicit things under normal conditions [(Othman, Shaarani, and Bahron (2016)].

God has provided more halal food than haram in the world. Al-Qur'an in surah Al-Baqarah verse 173 explains that indeed all food is halal except those which have been forbidden. Al Qur'an (5:3) also explains that Allah only forbids carcasses, blood, pork, and animals (animal flesh) when slaughtered called (name) other than Allah. Islam also forbids drinking liquor which is commonly called *khamar* (generally known as an alcoholic drink). Halal means activity which covers all the processes that start from cutting, storing, serving, preparing, health, and hygiene (Syafie & Othman, 2006). In addition to halal food, Islam also encourages consuming good dish (*thoyib*), for example, does not contain substances that harm the body. Consuming halal and good products is a *mutlaq* (absolute) and non-negotiable thing as Allah revealed in Al-Quran (5: 88)

According to the *Global religious futures*, the number of Indonesian Muslims in 2010 was 209.12 million people or around 87.17% of the total population of Indonesia. It is predicted that in 2020, Indonesia's Muslim population will increase to 256.82 million and 263.92 million by 2050. However, the percentage of the Muslim population will shrink to 86.39%. Contrary, the total world Muslim population in 2010 reached 1.6 billion people or around 23% of the total population and will increase and reach 6.9 billion in 2020.

Sharia economy is built on an economic system based on Islamic teachings and believed to bring economic justice include this consumption of halal products. This will certainly be a driving force, especially for the global halal product industry, because the demand for halal products is directly proportional to the increase in the Muslim population. The demand for halal products does not only comes from Muslims but also non-Muslims, this is due to the increasing preference and knowledge of non-Muslim communities to consume healthy products labeled as halal. This certainly shows that the potential for the development of the halal industry will be even greater. Not only in the country but also in countries with minority Muslim populations, not only in Muslim communities but also non-Muslims. The same thing applies to the banking industry where users of Islamic financial institutions' products and services, both banks and non-banks, not only develop in Muslim countries but also countries with minority Muslim populations.

Understanding on How Halal Product Produce

It can be said that all entrepreneurs in Ternate consider the importance of the existence of halal products and the commitment to produce halal products is based on the belief that all food products consumed by Muslims must be halal. Even though all the entrepreneurs in Ternate are aware that all products consumed by Muslims must be halal, but unfortunately not all of them embrace Islam. This condition raises another concern that they have a different perspective on the importance of halal products.

With regards to the general belief that products made by Muslims halal. The data shows that the larger scale of the enterprises, the confidence in the halal products produced decreases. This is caused by the control system of the production process. Microenterprises tend to have full control over the production process and raw materials used thus the confidence in the halal of the products produced is high. While small-sized and even medium-sized enterprises have relatively weaker control over the production process and the used materials so as reduces confidence in the halal products they produced. Besides, the halal status of a product is not only based on a simple criterion which is the absence of pork or contains alcohol but also based on the additional material used.

The result shows that there are very few micro-enterprises who already have halal certificates. This means that the number of enterprises that have not obtained halal certificates is far greater. Consequently, the guaranteed halal products in the market are less than the number of halal products that are not guaranteed. Also, although entrepreneurs in Ternate have a commitment and desire to produce halal products, in reality, the majority of entrepreneurs do not yet have halal certificates issued by LPPOM MUI as the authorized institution.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research analysis and discussion of halal products for micro and medium-sized enterprises in Ternate City, several conclusions can be drawn as follows:

- Economic behavior such as consumption and production of halal products, besides being a form of observance of religious teachings, it has also become a lifestyle for Muslim communities all over the world. This will be a driving factor for the growth of the halal industry because the demand for halal products will remain an increase in the market.
- The level of understanding of halal products in Ternate is very low. This is indicated by the majority of products produced that have not been officially tested for halal status since only a small proportion of products in Ternate have halal certificates from LPPOM MUI. Although many entrepreneurs claim that the products produced and traded are halal, the claim cannot be proven as valid.
- Halal products produced by enterprises in Ternate, especially by the micro and small-sized enterprises have been guaranteed by the enactment of Law No. 33 the year 2014 about Halal Product Guarantee (JPH). It aims to provide comfort, security, safety, and certainty for the public in consuming and using halal products.
- The diversity of halal products produced by micro and small-sized enterprises is nothing but to meet the demand for products that are getting higher day by day. Larger population and the increasing income among Muslim communities are causing an increase in the variation of halal products following the guidance of the Koran and hadith.
- The demand for halal products continues to increase globally, not only in the Muslim communities, but it has become a lifestyle for those who choose to use halal products.
- The strategy to increase enterprises' products to have halal certification in Ternate can be done in several ways as follow: Socialization, communication, harmonization, and dynamism. One of the phases/steps that can be developed as a strategy to improve the halal certification of products in Ternate is the determination/classification of enterprises.

REFERENCES

- Al-Qaradawi, Yusuf,(1999) The Lawful and the Prohibited in Islam (Al-Halal Wal Haram Fil Islam), Indiana: American Trust Publications
- Bohari, Abdul Manaf, Hin, Cheng Wei, Fuad, Nurwahida, (2013), The competitiveness of halal food industry in Malaysia: A SWOT ICT analysis, Geografia, Vol. 9 issue 1 (1 9), UKM
- Huda, A.N. (2012), "The development of Islamic financing scheme for SMEs in a developing country: the Indonesian case", Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, Vol. 52 No. 8, pp. 179-186
- Othman, Baharudin, Shaarani, Sharifudin Md. and Bahron, Arsiah, (2016). "An empirical analysis of Halal practices on organizational performance among food industries". International Journal of Current Research, 8, (03), 28909-28919
- Purnama, C. 2015. Sertifikasi Halal dalam Produk UMKM. radarsemarang

- Roberts, J. (2010), "Young, connected and Muslim", Marketing Week, available at: www.marketingweek.co.uk/in-depth-analysis/cover-stories/young-connected-and-muslim/3014934.article
- Shafie, S., and Othman, M.N. (2006). Halal certification: An international marketing issues and challenges. In Proceeding at the International IFSAM VIIIth World Congress, 28-30.
- Sudarmiatin, Suparti ,Anam, Faris Khoirul , and Wafaretta, Vega, (2020), "The Intention of Halal Certification by Micro Business" in International Conference on Islam, Economy, and Halal Industry, KnE Social Sciences, pages 141–155. DOI 10.18502/kss.v4i9.7322
- Taylor, Steven J., Bogdan, Robert., DeVaul, Marjorie L., (2016), Introduction to qualitative research methods: a guidebook and resource, 4th edition, Wiley