

PalArch's Journal of Archaeology
of Egypt / Egyptology

EFFECTIVENESS OF SISTER PROVINCE BETWEEN WEST JAVA AND CHONGQING IN THE TOURISM SECTOR

Yusep Ginanjar¹, Obsatar Sinaga², Taufik Hidayat³, Akim⁴

¹²³⁴Department of International Relations, Padjajaran University, Bandung, Indonesia

¹Yusep18001@mail.unpad.ac.id, ²Obsatar.sinaga@unpad.ac.id,

³Taufik.hidayat@unpad.ac.id, ⁴akim@unpad.ac.id

Yusep Ginanjar, Obsatar Sinaga, Taufik Hidayat, Akim. EFFECTIVENESS OF SISTER PROVINCE BETWEEN WEST JAVA AND CHONGQING IN THE TOURISM SECTOR--PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology 18(4), 4787-4799. ISSN 1567-214x

Keywords: Tourism, multitrack diplomacy, sister provinces

ABSTRACT

The form of diplomacy that is also carried out by local governments is part of multitrack diplomacy. Local governments as subnational entities are given the opportunity to carry out partnerships with partners abroad as part of supporting central government diplomacy. The most important goal of implementing sister province is actually to realize the welfare of society. Therefore, there is a need for full planning in order to maximize the benefits of a partnership. This paper uses qualitative research methods and secondary data sources obtained through library research. The purpose of this paper is to identify the factors that increase the effectiveness of sister provinces conducted by West Java and Chongqing. These factors are open discussion, problem analysis, agreement on strategies, objectives & results, joint steps in implementation, regular contacts, reporting, joint review of partnership progress and priority arrangement, also joint monitoring and evaluation.

INTRODUCTION

The growing of international relations involves a pattern of interaction in the form of diplomacy that is inseparable from the political influence and the prevailing international system. In this case, the political conditions both domestic and international politics can influence each other. The influence of both becomes an impetus for a state to translate their policies as well as diplomatic steps needed to be able to meet their interests and needs. Morgentahau (1961 in Damayanti) said that diplomacy is an important part of a nation's national strength in addition to resources, geographical conditions, industrial and military capabilities, population, and quality of government. Diplomacy today is not only run by state actors, but can also be done by other entities, including sub state entities. The practice of diplomacy that is not only carried out by state actors is called multitrack diplomacy. As a sub-state entity, local governments can also conduct diplomacy as part of multi-track diplomacy. Local governments as the part of the country now may form

partnerships with other entities abroad as an effort to support their state's diplomacy. The practice of diplomacy in this new model is a consequence of globalization and the interdependence between state actors and non-state actors.

The emergence of sub-national actors is a representation of the central government that can carry out foreign relations and carry out cooperation with other sub-national abroad in accordance with their respective levels for specific interests. Soldatos (1990) defines paradiplomacy as a form of diplomacy with a direct international scope carried out by sub national entities with the aim of supporting, completing, correcting, duplicating or challenging the diplomacy of a state. Paradiplomacy from that point of view is interpreted as a form of relationship pattern that emphasizes the ability of sub-national entities as a part of a state to carry out activities that cross territorial boundaries between countries. This shows that international relations not only open up opportunities for countries to see their needs, but also opportunities for the possibility of cross-border interactions that are carried out by various elements of a country on certain interests. These interests include understanding the needs and potentials of local governments because this could support the implementation of more effective and efficient diplomacy.

One form of interaction between sub-national entities in this case the local government, carried out by the Government of the Province of West Java (Indonesia) with the Provincial Government of Chongqing (China) as an embodiment of the concept of paradiplomacy. The partnership between the two is based on the cooperation that has been carried out between the Indonesian government and the Government of the People's Republic of China through the China National Tourism Administration (CNTA) in 2015 which was then revitalized in 2018 (Kemenpar, 2018). Since the establishment of a strategic partnership between China and Indonesia in 2005, China's economic and trade relations with West Java as Indonesia's sub-national unit have developed rapidly. Various collaborations and projects carried out by the two parties that established cooperation are based on the potential for cooperation that can be mutually beneficial for both parties. West Java as the most populous region in Indonesia which is rich in natural resources according to the Chinese Ambassador is a promising partner of cooperation. Some of the partnership areas that are the focus of both are strengthening in infrastructure development, the textile industry, agriculture, tourism and education. West Java on the other hand also shows its interest in being able to forge partnerships with Chongqing Province. This was demonstrated by a visit by the Government of the West Java Province in 2015 (Andrias, 2018).

West Java is one of the provinces in Indonesia with the highest number of foreign partnerships. It is interesting how the partnership with Chongqing is carried out well that many partnerships must be run by West Java. The partnership between those approved effective even when the partnership still goes on until 2022. Factors driving the effectivity of partnership implementation between West Java and Chongqing were the appropriateness choice of cooperation partners and the commitment of both parties to implement the partnership. This is evident from the progress of the existing partnership improvement and successful achievements. Successful achievements have been made by reducing the problems associated with illegal travel agents that have been agreed between West Java and Chongqing

to become a joint problem from the beginning of the discussion. This is interesting to be explored further considering that several foreign partnerships carried out by local governments as sub national mostly become stagnant in improvements. Therefore, this paper will discuss more about the factors that led to the success and effective partnership from the perspective of West Java. Research with the theme on potential factors for the practice of sister province by West Java was conducted by Andrias (2018). The study conducted by Andrias discussed the potential that West Java could do in its partnership with Chongqing in general. These potentials are mentioned as strategic locations, infrastructure sectors, industrial sectors, research and development, and other strategic markets.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature study is used to understand the research problems and the novelty of the research. Other research that is used as a reference is then reviewed for similarities, differences and contributions to this paper. In this paper three studies are used as references.

The first research referred to in this paper is *Going Beyond Paradiplomacy? Adding Institutional History to the Account for Regional Foreign Policy Competence*, written by Peter Bursens and Jana Deforche. The similarity between this research and this paper is the same theme of discussion, the implementation of paradiplomacy by local governments. A set of differences from studies with this paper is focus discussion. Although both of them discuss paradiplomacy, the research emphasizes the theoretical aspects of paradiplomacy practice. This paper, on the other hand, focuses more on the practical aspects, especially the factors for the success of the sister province carried out by the Government of West Java as part of the effectiveness of the partnership. In addition, this paper will discuss specifically about the tourism sector. This research, written by Burses ad Deforche, discusses theories about how historical institutions influence the practice of paradiplomacy, especially in the European region. This study is based on Soldatos and Keating's claims about the existence of the combined constitutional and institutional internal and external impacts that influence the policy making process in Europe. The study further uses historical institutionalism to explain developments in the regions and sub-state of the country in conducting foreign relations. This study provides input on how domestic relations carried out by state actors or other entities are still affected by domestic and international situations. This is what results in the type of foreign relations being carried out, the partners chosen, and what goals must be achieved.

The second study referred to in this paper is *American Diplomacy and Climate Change as Actors in Global Climate Governance*, written by Thomas D. Eatmon. The similarity of studies conducted by Eatmon and this paper is to discuss the big topics of paradiplomacy at the same administrative level. The focus of the two discussions is different because when Eatmon's study focuses on how the practice of paradiplomacy which is carried out affects the role of sub-state entities in global issues, while this paper discusses more about the factors driving the effectiveness of sister provinces conducted by the local government to build relationships with its partners as well as for the welfare of society. In addition, this paper specifically discusses sister provinces in the field of tourism and includes more specific languages, while Eatmon discusses

a broader topic of climate change as a global issue. Study conducted by Eatmon discusses the different responses given by each state in the United States on the issue of climate change. National policies clearly show that the United States did not ratify international agreements to limit carbon emissions. However, policies at the state level that differ from national policies indicate the existence of sub-state entity's authority to determine its own policies. Eatmon's study contributes to explain how political policy is taken within a country and how the distribution of power takes place between the central government and its sub-statistic entities. This study also explains how the paradigm carried out by sub-state entities can influence policy direction and decision making at the national level.

The third study referred to in this paper is *Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro*, written by Marcos Vinícius Isaias Mendes and Ariane Roder Figueira. This journal has similarity with this paper because it discusses the theme of paradiplomacy. The difference from the third journal with this paper is, if the third journal discusses paradiplomacy in the framework of cooperation between cities (sister city), while this paper will discuss paradiplomacy between the provincial administrative level that is carried out by West Java and Chongqing. The study's contribution to this paper is to provide an understanding of the significance and competitive side of the sub-states in determining and carrying out foreign relations. This study explores the process of how Rio de Janeiro can be chosen to host the 2016 Olympics. It was stated that to achieve this Rio increased the capacity of its resources and maintain reliable image globally.

METHODOLOGY

There are many dimensions in social problems that must be sought for explanation in order to find the meaning of the phenomenon. Based on Creswell's theory (2009), qualitative research is a method to discuss and understand the meaning collected by individuals or groups that are ascribed to social or welfare problems. Therefore, to understand the meaning of the partnership carried out by the Provinces of West Java and Chongqing used qualitative research methods. Use of qualitative research methods to consider which will discuss research relating to the social dimension and social participation. This type of research is a descriptive exploratory study that aims to review social facts by analyzing a phenomenon as a whole. The qualitative method is based on factors to analyze the effectivity of sister province that carried out by West Java with Chongqing Province.

Research data will be presented in the form of sentences obtained from observation and understanding from the point of view of the researcher as the main instrument of research (Moelong, 2007). The data presented is secondary data obtained from the process of collecting relevant books, journals, articles, documents and internet searches as data sources. In other words, the data collection in this paper uses the study of literature. The data obtained then analyzed carefully by reading the data obtained and selecting the most relevant and able to explain what factors increase the effectiveness of sister province between West Java and Chongqing. Furthermore, data triangulation is done to test the validity of the data by comparing with similar data from different sources.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Sister Province of West Java Province and Chongqing Province in the Tourism Sector

The period of globalization has made the role of regional governments increasingly in regulating the lives of their people, especially related to economic and social aspects. This fact also increases local government awareness related to opportunities and external obstacles that can affect the lives of its people. Encouraged by the widespread need, a bureaucratic structure is needed to support efforts to pursue regional interests. This is because automatically with the complexity of issues and social dimensions that exist, there is need between state or sub-state entities to interact with each other through representative offices (Keohane, 1974). The relationship between sub-state entities that cross state lines is called transgovernmental relations. This relationship provides flexibility for sub-state entities in conducting partnerships with other sub-national entities abroad. Slaughter (2004, in Whytock 2009) divides transgovernmental relationships into 3 categories, namely:

- a. Government networks in international organizations
- b. Government network through partnership signed by the head of government
- c. Partnership relationships run by sub-state entities.

Sister province partnership that occurs between West Java and Chongqing is the third type, namely the partnership relationship run by sub-state entities. This can be seen from the head of the local government of the two parties who signed the agreement as part of Indonesia and China. As part of the support for diplomacy carried out by each central government, however the practice of diplomacy carried out by the regional government will certainly be different, but it must remain in harmony with the existing national interests. The practice of diplomacy carried out by local governments can be done through a series of programs compiled in partnership with foreign countries taking into account existing regulations. Regulations governing sister provinces carried out by regional governments in Indonesia existed prior to the enactment of regional autonomy through Minister of Home Affairs Regulation (Permendagri) No. 1 of 1992 concerning the implementation of relations and sister provinces abroad. The regulation was then replaced by Permendagri No. 3 of 2008 concerning Guidelines for Implementing Regional Sister Province with Overseas Parties. In addition, there are some legal basis for the practice of paradiplomacy namely:

- Law No. 37 of 1999 concerning Foreign Relations which explains the implementation of foreign relations is not only carried out by the central government and can be done with presidential instructions and facilitated by the foreign minister.
- Law No. 24 of 2000 concerning International Treaties which explains the technical making of international treaties on paradiplomacy.
- Law Number 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Government and Law Number 23 of 2014 regulating the involvement of the Regional People's Representative Council in the practice of diplomacy related to the supervision and management of the use of Regional Revenue and Expenditures Budget/*Anggaran Pedapatan dan Belanja Daerah* (APBD).

This set of legal basis forms the partnership that exists between West Java and Chongqing. Chongqing Province has a total trade value of US \$ 1.2 billion with total investment from Chongqing in Indonesia already reaching 140 million US dollars including the automotive industry with the DFSK brand (Kemlu RI, 2019). Chongqing Deputy Congressman Liu Xuepu expects the development of partnerships with Indonesia in potential fields such as communication and information technology, trade & economics, smart industries, education, cultural exchange, and tourism (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2019). Chongqing's economic development is very rapid considering that in 2018 economic growth reached 15.9% compared to China's growth in general of 6.6%. The Chinese government based on these conditions then made Chongqing as the One Belt One Road crossing path to Europe and Southeast Asia.

The intensive partnership that exists between Indonesia and China has had an impact with the expansion of the partnership not only at the central government level, but also at the local government level. One of the partnerships made by the regional government is the partnership that exists between the Provincial Government of West Java and the Provincial Government of Chongqing. The partnership is established by focusing on seven points, namely (West Java Regional Secretariat, 2017):

- The need for foreign partnerships based on the principle of equality and mutually beneficial relations.
- Conduct joint research in the field of science and technology development carried out by various institutions between the two parties (West Java and Chongqing) that produce products with useful and applicative values.
- In the field of tourism and culture, the West Java Provincial Government will benefit from an increase in the number of tourists coming from China.
- The technical and management sector of increasing the capacity of the West Java Provincial Government will benefit from the implementation of Good Governance and Clean Governance between West Java and Chongqing.
- The economy and trade will benefit from a stable trade climate and access to superior quality commodities between the two parties.
- In the education sector, the Government of West Java Province is expected to actively increase human resources, not only to focus on exchanging students, lecturers, teachers and sister schools or sister universities. Other parties must also be included, for example workers, business people, and others.
- Development of partnerships in the field of transportation development in rural or urban areas. This is done by business people and related companies.
- The promotion of business people between the two parties is carried out on an ongoing and routine basis.

Chongqing has the potential to be a promising partner for West Java in the tourism sector with a population of 31 million. This large number can potentially be used as tourists to Indonesia. In the tourism sector alone, Indonesian Foreign Ministry statistics show 60 thousand Chongqing tourists visited Indonesia in 2018. On the other hand, 30 thousand Indonesian tourists visited Chongqing in the same year. The data shows that there is a potential for

the tourism sector to become a strategic sector for partnerships between West Java and Chongqing given that they are densely populated areas. Not to mention the high value of Chongqing's investment can help the economic condition of West Java by opening new jobs to reduce unemployment. All these aspects illustrate that the partnership with Chongqing will be very promising for West Java in particular and Indonesia in general both in terms of economic and political relations. West Java is also a potential partner for Chongqing, seen from some of the potentials of West Java (Pikira Rakyat, 2017), namely: First, the potential of Human Resources is reaching 47.38 million people as a large market for investors; Secondly, Contribution of 13.08% to Indonesia's GDP is at the third rank after DKI Jakarta and East Java. Even in the manufacturing aspect accounted for Indonesia's GDP of 43.03%; Third, it has positive and relatively stable economic employment trends from inflation; Fourth, the number of tourism objects that can be developed such as the Ciletuh Geopark-Pelabuhan Ratu which has been named the UNESCO Global Geopark.

Overall, the brief data presentation shows that the partnership between West Java and Chongqing has the potential to mutually benefit for both parties. This is because in addition to having tremendous potential for each party, both of them have a similar focus on the cooperation sector. The scope of the partnership will not only be related to economic aspects, but also related to technology, political and socio-cultural transfers. So that if implemented well this partnership will certainly not only strengthen relations between the two parties or provide benefits for each party, but also build the potential of other partnerships that are bigger and wider. The indicator of the success of the partnership between West Java and Chongqing is measured by the extent to which the partnership's goals are achieved each year. This will assist stakeholders in evaluating cooperation every year not only in the realm of paradiplomacy but also in relation to partnerships that are generally established between Indonesia and China in the tourism sector.

In addition, in the field of tourism, the fields prioritized and reviewed in this study, the programs formed relate to how they both promote and facilitate tourism in two directions. It is said two ways because in its implementation, the tourism sector that each is favored can be coordinated with each other to increase promotion and the benefits that can be obtained. The meeting between tourism agents from West Java and Chongqing to support tourism promotion and cooperation activities through joint discussions and coordination will also be held as an effort to support the joint tourism sector. This day is inseparable from the urgency of the tourism sector for both and problems related to illegal tourism agents that must be addressed immediately. Because its presence inhibits tourism activities between the two.

The program involves the implementation of arts and cultural exchanges which are implemented in a collaborative activity called "Sister Province Night". This activity is planned to be held both in Bandung and in Chongqing. In this activity there are arts and cultural performances between the Provinces of West Java and Chongqing Province, where through this show, it is hoped that the culture which is the identity of the two can be mutually introduced and promoted to the general public. This is very important in improving the tourism sector, because the arts and culture possessed by an area has its own characteristics that are a special attraction for tourists. The urgency of tourism

that makes this sector vital for the country is closely related to the various benefits it can bring so as to complement economic growth and the development of a country's branding value as an identity so that it will gradually have an impact on other sectors and the welfare of society.

Data from United Nations World Tourism Organizations shows that China ranks the top contributor to global tourism expenditure with a transaction value of 102 million USD in 2012 that increased 40% from the previous year (UNWTO, 2013). Based on these data it can be seen that China has a large expenditure budget for foreign travel so this has become a potential market including for Indonesia as a source of foreign exchange income in tourism. Growth in the tourism sector will also help the general economic growth of the community. In order to realize the great value of tourists from China, a variety of programs and strategic policies are needed to be able to build tourism infrastructure and implement strategies in the comprehensive tourism sector. The development plan for the tourism sector between Indonesia and China has been carried out since the meeting on 16 and 17 September 2013. Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy Mari Elka Pangestu as Indonesian representative accompanied by the Indonesian Embassy official in Beijing met with the Chairman of the China National Tourism Administration (CNTA) Shao Qiwei with his vice Du Jiang as the Chinese representative who discussed the renewal of the Momentandum of Understanding (MoU) in the field of tourism which emphasized more concrete implementation of pre-existing plans (Pikiran Rakyat, 2013).

The MoU, which was approved since July 10, 2000, has detailed agreements to encourage promotion, information transfer, tourism travel facilities to tourism capacity and investment between the two. This means that with the MoU underlying the cooperation of the two countries, both Indonesia and China stress the importance of joint collaboration in the tourism sector. Development in the tourism sector is carried out in the mechanism of implementing cooperation through the existence of concrete Action Plans including joint promotion, information sharing, travel facilitation, capacity building, and tourism investment in both countries. This cooperation is expected not only to occur at the central government level, but also at the regional government level as well as cooperation between the tourism industries of the two countries. Not only through this collaboration, but also changes to regulations both Indonesia and China. Such as the ratification of the Tourism Act on April 25, 2013 by the Chinese government which took effect on October 1 in the same year which emphasized the strategy of working tourism products by related industries (Supriyanto, 2013). Then the various regulations formed by Indonesia and China become a benchmark for both of them to not only continue to develop and evaluate the cooperation or partnership that has been built in the MoU or a series of existing work programs. But it also serves as a benchmark for expanding cooperation in the tourism sector in the scope of provinces and cities, as well as sister province partnerships carried out by West Java Province with Chongqing Province.

Effectiveness of Sister Province between West Java Province and Chongqing Province in the Tourism Sector

The Proposed Medium-term Plan prepared by the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy and the mandate of the President of the Republic of Indonesia serve as a special reference to form the Strategic Plan of the

Ministry of Tourism in 2015-2019. Tourism has become a significant strategic sector in contributing to income and the development of the country's economy in both foreign exchange and Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Tourism is also a media in providing employment opportunities for the community by targeting in 2019 the number of foreign tourist arrivals to reach 20 million and the movement of tourists to reach 275 million trips (Kemenparekraf, 2015). The tourism sector is one of the priority sectors in the administration of President Joko Widodo, seen from the commitment to build and guarantee tourism infrastructure as a support that is reflected in the promotion of tourism destinations by the Ministry of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia to the planned increase in funding allocation of Rp 4.95 trillion in the Draft Budget Revenue and State Expenditures in 2020 (CNBC Indonesia, 2019).

West Java Province which has partnered with foreign parties include Chongqing forms Governor Regulation No. 44 of 2015 concerning the Grand Design of Regional Cooperation of the Regional Government of West Java Province 2015 - 2018 (Jabarprov.go.id, 2018). The purpose of foreign partnerships formed by the West Java Provincial Government is to make tourism an aspect that contributes to regional development. For the sake of the success of the partnership established between West Java and China, coordination between institutions and parties involved in planning and implementing program activities is needed. This is so that the mechanism used will also be more intensive so that the results will be more effective. This effective outcome will certainly bring opportunities for capacity building and competence in collaborative governance in each field as a whole. Some things that are said to be an obstacle according to the Government of the Province of West Java in the implementation of sister province cooperation or partnership include the change of tenure of officials and leaders in regional governments having a close relationship with the path and direction of each regulation or policy formed.

The partnership that exists between the West Java Provincial Government and the Chongqing Government is certainly based on the aspect of mutualism in the benefits gained by both parties. So that the expected goal of this partnership is a successful partnership, in other words effective in its implementation. In 2009, Buis conducted research on the role of local government associations in increasing the effectiveness of inter-city partnerships. Buis (2009) suggests the success factors that increase the influence of both parties so as to produce greater benefits to the aspects of mutuality in partnership: Factors driving effectiveness according to Buis can be a reference for the implementation of partnerships within the framework of sister city or sister province in general. This is also a reference in this research that examines partnerships carried out by the West Java Province and Chongqing Province. The factors driving effectiveness according to Buis, namely:

a. Open Discussion

This first factor was clearly demonstrated through the delivery of both intentions in establishing a Letter of Intent (LoI) between the Provincial Government of West Java and the Provincial Government of Chongqing on March 17, 2015 in Bandung. The LoI then developed and improved the status of its cooperation to become a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). When the partnership phase becomes an MoU, the drafting of the agreement between

the two parties concerned becomes the media to convey to each other what fields are expected to be developed together. Both of them also not only consider each other's existing potentials, but also the problems faced so that they can prioritize and formulate the strategies and policies needed to handle the issues.

b. Problem Analysis

West Java and Chongqing mutually evaluate and analyze problems that can hamper the development of the tourism sector that is seeded by them as fellow partners. One of them is evaluating the problems of a variety of cheap and uninsured tour and travel agents in Chongqing with destinations to Indonesia. Tourism agents both tour and travel agents who are illegal are not registered as a body certified by the state or local government or by tourism agencies. According to Ms. Chandra Wulan, the Foreign Cooperation Section of the West Java Provincial Government, the results of the partnership in handling the problem of illegal travel agents in accordance with the Joint Working Group meeting in August 2018, travel agents from Chongqing have collaborated with travel agents in West Java to can make and get traveling packages to Chongqing. With this coordination, the two regional governments can also work on ways to improve the security of each travel agent. Because the two local governments get the information needed through coordination that is carried out as a form of monitoring of existing travel agents.

c. Agreement on Strategy, Objectives and Results

The third factor is related to the existence of an agreed strategy, clear objectives and results between both parties. This indicator involves the whole process starting from the level of planning or strategy formation as part of the required policies in accordance with certain considerations to the implementation of the partnership. The partnership between West Java and Chongqing from the start emphasized an agreement to determine the strategy, objectives and desired outcomes. One of them is proven by establishing the Sister nights' program as a form of tourism promotion and dealing with the problem of illegal travel agents.

d. Joint Steps in Implementation

The factor is closely related to the existence of synergy owned by the Provincial Government of West Java and the Provincial Government of Chongqing in carrying out programs or activities that have been prepared and agreed upon together. The need for synergy or collaboration between the two parties so that they are mutually involved in the entire partnership process from planning to implementation without being burdened by either of them. even there was a Joint Working Group between the West Java Provincial Government and Chongqing Provincial Government on August 2, 2018.

e. Regular Contacts

Regular contact is reflected in the formation of the Joint Working Group, as a group formed by the Provincial Governments of West Java and Chongqing Province. This group contains representatives from government officials with the private sector who will manage the implementation of program activities in each field both short and long term. The Joint Working Group also conducts regular meetings which are held once a year and are carried out alternately as an evaluation of the implementation of this program discussed at the meeting.

f. Reporting

The reporting function is carried out to review the partnership carried out. One

of the realization is reflected in the agreement document in the form of Record of Discussion (ROD) on August 2, 2018. The ROD generated from each meeting periodically becomes the media to provide mutual review reports to each other which forms the basis for the two to review each other's discussions from the meeting. has been done and all work programs that have been and will be carried out.

g. **Joint Review of Partnership Progress and Priority Arrangements & Joint Monitoring and Evaluation**

The explanation of the seventh and eighth points is related to the evaluation and evaluation conducted by both parties in implementing the partnership program. This stage is done to see the extent to which the objectives and programs carried out meet the expectations of both parties and which programs are priorities. Both parties in West Java and Chongqing through a joint working group held a meeting to conduct the necessary evaluation and review. It can be seen from overall discussion to the factors influencing the effectiveness of the sister province partnership from Buis that the partnership between West Java and Chongqing can be said to be effective. Apart from these factors there are two special characteristics that play an important role in seeing how local governments can increase effectiveness in cooperation or partnerships with other regions abroad, including sister provinces. These characteristics are the existence of initiatives to start the cooperation by the local government or national sub-unit of a state, as well as the quality improvement in cooperation or partnerships with foreign regions (Buis, 2009). Based on the evaluation, according to Ms. Chandra, the implementation of the partnership between West Java and Chongqing has begun to provide significant results related to the implementation of the program of activities and handling problems that exist in the tourism sector. However, several things remain obstacles and challenges for the continued implementation of the existing program, which is related to COVID-19. This obstacle is something that West Java must be able to deal with by becoming more persuasive in fostering diplomatic relations with Chongqing. The Government of West Java also needs to develop the strategies needed related to the sustainability of the program activities.

CONCLUSION

Partnerships between sub-state entities in the period of globalization do promise benefits that can help to develop the potential of the actors. Therefore, many partnerships within the framework of paradiplomacy are carried out by local governments, including in Indonesia. West Java as one of the most populous provinces in Indonesia also runs partnerships with many foreign partners. Chongqing as one of West Java's strategic partners agreed on a partnership within the sister province framework, including in the field of tourism. The purpose of the partnership that is carried out, in addition to increasing the close relationship between the two parties, is also aimed at promoting each other's potential and achieving prosperity. The tourism sector which is a vital sector for both parties will also be the focus of this partnership. As the result, both agreed to promote each other's tourism and provide support to eradicate illegal travel.

Achievement of the success from the partnership established shows the effectiveness of the partnership. The factors that are indicators of achieving the

effectiveness of this partnership include, open discussion, problem analysis, agreement on strategies, objectives & results, joint steps in implementation, regular contacts, reporting, joint review of partnership progress & priority arrangements, also joint monitoring and evaluation. Although this partnership is still ongoing, it has shown positive achievements in its implementation. What remains a problem in this partnership is the existence of the Covid-19 pandemic. This pandemic is very influential in the tourism sector so that it has the potential to disrupt the achievement of partnerships between the two parties. Therefore, an agreement is needed on how to implement the partnership in unpredictable conditions to overcome the impacts that can hamper the partnership's achievement between the two.

REFERENCES

- Buis, Hans. (2009). The Role of Local Government Associations in Increasing the Effectiveness of City-to-City Cooperation. *Habitat International* 33(2):190-194.
- Bursens, Peter & Deforche, Jana. (2010). Going Beyond Paradiplomacy Adding Historical Institutionalism to Account for Regional Foreign Policy Competences. *Hague Journal of Diplomacy*, 5, 151-171.
- CNBC News. "Hadapi Gejolak Global, Jokowi Ajak China Pererat Hubungan". *CNBC Indonesia*. <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20181114164740-4-42155/hadapi-gejolak-global-jokowi-ajak-china-pererat-hubungan>.
- Creswell, John. W. (2009). *Research Design Quantitative, Qualitative, Mixed Method Approaches*. California: Sage Publications.
- Damayanti, Christy. (2012). "Potensi Paradiplomasi Dalam Mendukung Kinerja Diplomasi Indonesia Menuju Komunitas ASEAN". Online. *Jurnal Transformasi* Vol 14, No. 22.
- Darmayadi, Andrias. (2018). Potential Cooperation Between West Java Provincial Government and the City of Chongqing in the Framework of sister province. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research. International Conference on Business, Economic, Social Sciences and Humanities*, pp. 72-77.
- Eatmon, Thomas D. (2009). Paradiplomacy and Climate Change: American States as Actors in Global Climate Governance, *Journal of Natural Resources Policy Research*, Vol. 1, No. 2, 153–165.
- Jawa Barat Open Data. Maksimalkan Potensi Pariwisata Wujudkan Jawa Barat Sebagai Provinsi Pariwisata. <https://data.jabarprov.go.id/infographic/maksimalkan-potensi-pariwisata-wujudkan-jawa-barat-sebagai-provinsi-pariwisata>.
- Kemenpar.go.id. "Kemenpar dan CNTA Sepakat Tingkatkan Kerjasama Pariwisata". Ministry of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia. <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=3894>.
- Kementerian Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif Republik Indonesia. "Rencana Strategis Kementerian Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif 2015-2019". <http://www.kemendparekraf.go.id/index.php/post/rencana-strategis-2015-2019-kementerian-pariwisata>.
- Kemlu.go.id. "Menjemput Sejuta Peluang Kerja Sama di Chongqing". <https://kemlu.go.id/beijing/id/ext-news/812/menjemput-sejuta-peluang-kerja-sama-di-chongqing>.

- Keohane, Robert O & Nye Joseph S. (1974). Transgovernmental Relations and International Organizations. *World Politics*, 27(1), 39-62.
- Mendes, Marcos Vinícius Isaias & Figueira, Ariane Roder. (2017). Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro. *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 60(1): e012, 2017.
- Moleong, Lexy J. (2007). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosadakarya.
- Pikiran Rakyat.com. "Ini Segudang Potensi di Jawa Barat yang Menggiurkan bagi Investor Timur Tengah". <https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/bandung-raya/2017/10/06/ini-segudang-potensi-di-jawa-barat-yang-menggiurkan-bagi-investor-timur>.
- Soldatos, P. (1990). An Explanatory Framework for the Study of Federated States as Foreign-policy Actors, in: Michelmann, H., Soldatos, P., *Federalism and International Relations. The Role of Subnational Units*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Supriyanto, Bambang. Kerjasama Pariwisata RI-China Diperbaharui Ini Poin pentingnya. <https://ekonomi.bisnis.com/read/20130917/12/163506/kerja-sama-pariwisata-ri-china-diperbarui-ini-poin-pentingnya>.
- United Nation World Tourism Organizations. "China New Number One Tourism Source Market World". <https://www.unwto.org/archive/global/press-release/2013-04-04/china-new-number-one-tourism-source-market-world>.
- Whytock, Christopher. (2009). A Rational Design Theory of Transgovernmentalism: The Case of US-EU Merger Review Cooperation. *Boston University International Law Journal*. 23, 151.