PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology

AN OVERVIEW OF L2 MOTIVATIONAL RESEARCH IN PAKISTAN

Ihsan Ali[1], Asif Aziz[2], Abdullah Mukhtar[3], Quynh Dzung Dang[4]

[1,3]University of Management and Technology, Sialkot, Pakistan.

[2]Govt. College for Elementary Teachers Male Mirpur AJ&K Pakistan

[4]Dai Nam University, Hanoi, Vietnam.

Abstract:

L2 motivational research has 60 years of history. During this period many models of L2 motivation have been presented extended from the socio-educational model of Gardner and Lambart (1959) to Dörnyei's (2009) L2 Motivational Self System. However, only three models; socio-educational model, willingness to communicate in L2 and the L2 Motivational Self System have been explored and validated in the context of Pakistan. Moreover, willingness to communicate has been investigated with other factors; L2 anxiety and Self Perceived Communicative Competence. This overview shows that these studies use very limited data yet the findings have been generalized to a large population. Especially, the L2 motivation has not been studied in multiple factors; the age of the L2 learners, educational backgrounds, educational level, and educational field. Moreover, there is a lack of research that mainly focuses on classroom-situated and context-situated motivational strategies. It shows a huge gap between theoretical considerations and practical implications of the L2 motivational research in the present context.

This paper suggests that more researches in the L2 motivation are required in the context of Pakistan, focusing on classroom-situated factors and context-situated factors.

Introduction:

Pakistan came into being in 1947 after winning its freedom from the British rule. The English language was the official language before the emergence of Pakistan so it remained as the official language until now. Moreover, the Urdu language was adopted as the national language along with more than sixty-six languages spoken in the country. Thus, English maintained its importance and still enjoys the status of the second and prestigious language in this context. It is taught as a subject from the first standard to graduation level. Therefore, L2 learners in Pakistan have a great motivation to learn it as they are not promoted to the next standard if they don't pass in their English exams.

Generally speaking, the second language learning motivation is being explored since Gardner and Lambart gave their socio-educational model in 1959. Since then many new models have been presented; the Self Determination Theory (1985), the Attribution Theory (1985), Goal Setting Theory (1990), Goal Orientation Theory (1992), a Framework of L2 Learning (1994), William and Burden's Model of L2 Motivation (1997), Process Model of L2 Motivation (1998), Willingness to Communicate (1998) and Motivational Self System (2005). Though the literature shows that the Pakistani L2 students have a very vast and intricate yet the construct of the socio-educational model of L2 motivation & the L2 Motivational Self System have more explored frequently as well as the effect of Willingness to Communicate in L2 against L2 Anxiety and Self Perceived Communicative Competence have been researched less.

Socio-educational Model of L2 motivation in Pakistan:

This modal shows a dichotomy in the field of L2 motivational research as it highlights instrumental motivation and integrative motivation as the major forces that influence the motivation of the L2 learners. The latter refers to a learner's desire to integrate or communicate with the members of the target language and the former entails utilitarian motives or functional purposes such as getting employment, promotion in an existing job or passing an examination or traveling abroad or going abroad for higher studies. Though it has been criticized a lot yet its fame and feasibility in all the contexts is not diminished.

As far as L2 motivational research in Pakistan is concerned, instrumental motivation and integrative motivation have been found influential to a great extent. Moreover, the findings show that the Pakistani L2 learning students are instrumentally more motivated than integratively (Pathan, Shehriar & Mari, 2010; Rehman et al., 2014; Siming et al., 2015; Khalid, 2016; Ali & Ahmed, 2018; Anam, Ali & Mughal, 2019). The reasons are quite obvious as English enjoys the status of prestigious and international language since the start. It has great utilitarian values in Pakistan (Khan, 2014). The Pakistani L2 students aspire for a better career, wish to travel abroad, pass

the local examinations, want to have a good status in the society and have strong longings to be employed that form their instrumental motivation. As, Jabeen et al. (2011) said that instrumental factors like aspiration about future employment, getting a higher education, passing the local examination, visiting a foreign country and getting a social status are also important motives of L2 learning in the Pakistani context. On the other hand, though they have fewer chances of interaction with the natives yet they have a desire to interact with the international community and L2 speaking community that overall encourages them to learn English forming their integrative motivation. This puts a question mark on the validity of Gardner's notion of integrative orientation in Pakistani context where the learners with poor socio-economic backgrounds can barely get a chance to interact with the English language community (Ghani, 2003). However, a positive attitude and a good level of instrumental and integrative motivation are found in students of both genders and relatively higher instrumental motivation in male students towards learning English. As shown by Anam, Ali & Mughal (2019) who presented the overall high degree of interest of the Pakistani L2 learners in learning English as a Second Language. Therefore, it can't be denied that the socio-educational model has a great significance in the Pakistani context.

However, most of the researches in the present context are limited in their theoretical and methodological designs as they use mostly quantitative approach for collecting and analyzing the data. Further, the data has been collected from a very limited sample like undergraduate, graduate and post-graduate university students leaving lower secondary and elementary L2 students altogether and the results are generalized to a large population. For instance, Pathan, Shahriar and Mari (2016) used quantitative approach and collected data from 145 undergraduate university students , Siming et al. (2015) also used quantitative approach and collected data from 80 undergraduate university students, Khalid (2016) used quantitative approach and collected data from 57 public school students, and Rehman et al. (2014) used quantitative approach and collected data from only 50 private college students. Anam, Ali & Mughal (2019) that the future investigators are recommended to take a greater number of samples and collect qualitative data through interviews to raise the degree of generalization so that their findings become more reliable. There is a dire need to conduct research using a qualitative approach or both qualitative and quantitative approaches to generalize the findings of L2 motivation in the current scenario. Moreover, L2 motivation studies in Pakistan lack with the perception of other influential factors like aptitude, age, gender, educational background, institute background and the field of the study. Research is also needed to explore L2 motivation concerning age, sex, intelligence, behavior, past learning experience, L2 competence, and other personality traits like learning styles. Khan (2014) suggested that research is needed to explore the relationship of L2 motivation with other factors; language aptitude, anxiety, L2 and L2 learning process. Further, in order to support L2 learning, Pathan, Shehriar & Mari (2010) have suggested to develop friendly environment, improve teaching pedagogy, Khan (2014) has stressed on providing more communicative chances to L2 learners, parental encouragement and improving

L2 learning experience and Rehman (2014) has focused on the role of L2 teachers and the L2 course contents. Unfortunately, all these areas for L2 motivation are also unexplored.

The L2 Willingness to Communicate in Pakistan:

Another important subject of exploration & investigation has been Willingness to Communicate (WTC) which is defined as "a learner's readiness to enter into discourse at a particular time with a specific person or persons using an L2" (McIntyre, Clement, Dornyei, and Noels, 1998). According to this model, variables such as L2 motivation and self-confidence have direct effects on WTC in an L2 while variables such as personality, attitude, and L2 competence have an indirect influence on WTC, (Bukhari, Cheng & Khan, 2015). Therefore, it has great significance in the L2 learning process. However, there are only a few research studies conducted in Pakistan. For instance, Shahbaz et al. (2016) posited that WTC is also one of the important factors in determining the L2 learning process in Pakistan. He claims that acquaintance level with the participants and contexts of language use may be the important factors to affect the WTC of learners. Further, Bukhari, Cheng and Khan (2015) state that the Pakistani college students' Willingness to Communicate is relatively high and they prefer to initiate talk in English with friends and acquaintances rather than strangers. However, they have noticed that L2 students like to use English in their private discourse and are unwilling to use English in the public which shows their lack of confidence and reluctance for using English.

Unfortunately, this construct also falls short of theoretical and practical implications in Pakistan as it has been explored with fewer sample and only the participants were taken from the university. For example, Bukhari, Cheng and Khan (2015) used quantitative approach and collected data from 170 undergraduate university students, and Shahbaz et al. (2016) also used quantitative approach and collected data from 88 university students. Thus, this construct also requires to be studied with larger sample size and the participants must be selected from various educational levels

The L2 Anxiety in Pakistan:

L2 anxiety in Pakistan is explored with L2 willingness to communicate and self-perceived communication competence against the frequency of use of English as L2. Generally speaking, the psychological construct of anxiety is defined as "the subjective feeling of tension, apprehension, nervousness, and worry ……." (Spielberger, 1983). It has many types and influenced by multiple factors. However, L2 anxiety is situation-specific which is experienced as recurring in the well-defined situation of the foreign language classroom (Horwitz, Horwitz and Cope, 1991).

According to Ghani and Azhar (2017), the L2 anxiety is found to have a weak and negative effect on the Pakistani students' frequent use of L2. It can be guessed that they are afraid of speaking L2 in front of the people. They think that they may make grammatical mistakes or ridiculed by the listeners if they use English incorrectly. This produces L2 anxiety in them and they show an unwillingness to communicate in L2 for face-saving. Nawaz at al. (2015) explain that L2 anxiety & fear is created with the

L2 students' lack of confidence, social pressure and the lack of self-perceived L2 competence. Therefore, L2 anxiety can also be an important factor affecting L2 in Pakistan. Unlikely it has been investigated poorly with limited sample and narrow approach too in Pakistan. As, Nawaz et al. (2015) collected data from 50 undergraduate university students and Ghani & Azhar (2017) collected data from 123 university postgraduate students. Therefore, it also calls for more extensive studies in the current scenario.

Self Perceived Communicative Competence (SPCC)

Another least explored area of L2 motivation in Pakistan is Self Perceived Communicative Competence (SPCC). It states how an individual perceives her/his competence for spoken communication in a certain context (Mc Croskey, 1984). It is important because awareness of personal strengths and weaknesses helps students to "adjust their cognition and thinking to be more adaptive to diverse tasks and, thus, facilitate learning" (Pintrich, 2002).

In his study, Shahbaz et al. (2016) explored that in an informal context, there exists a positive relationship between SPCC and WTC in any particular language. It entails, if learners have a positive SPCC in a language, they demonstrate a strong WTC in the same language. Ghani & Azhar (2017) also showed that SPCC is a significant factor affecting the frequency of L2 usage among the postgraduate students of English in Pakistan. Therefore they suggest that L2 instructor's professional and training courses should include special topics based on the importance of SPCC. However, this construct also lacks practical and theoretical considerations due to limited research investigations. It also demands more elaborated studies in the present context.

The L2 Motivational Self System in Pakistan:

Another frequent investigated model of L2 motivation in Pakistan is the L2 Motivational Self System. It was proposed by Dörnyei in 2005 and validated in 2009. It has three components: Ideal L2 Self, ought-to Self, and language learning experience. The first self is the learner's vision of becoming as an effective L2 speaker. The second self is the social pressure coming from the learner's environment. The third component refers to the L2 learning experience. It does not concern "to self-image but with the situation in the learning process" (Tort, 2015). The underlying principle of this model is that motivation does not arise when learners identify with speakers of the language but with future versions of their selves.

In this context, the Pakistani L2 students have shown strong validity. The role of English internationally makes them aware of their L2 visions. For them, English is the door to the international job market. The materialistic approach of Pakistani students to learn English is the most significant factor of their L2 learning motivation and it creates future related images, the ideal L2 Self & the Ought to Self. These future associated self-identities motivate them to put their efforts into learning a second language (Yaqoob, Ahmed & Arshad, 2014). Islam (2013) also validated the significance of the L2 Motivational Self System in the Pakistani context. The ideal L2 Self has emerged as the strongest incubator more than the Ought to Self though it is

also influential. His research findings also added a new factor in the mainstream L2 motivational research; the national interest. According to Nawaz et al. (2015), the Ideal L2 Self and the Ought to Self both are found important in the Pakistani context. Further, their findings show that international posture, attitude towards L2 and L2 anxiety and fear are also core factors influencing L2 motivation. Similarly, the research findings of Ali (2016) also validated Dornyei's Ideal L2 Self. Further, he highlighted some factors; L2 indigenous integrative orientation, national Islamic Interests and voicing female rights. The first is related to the use of L2 for local purposes, the second pertains to learning L2 for the propagation of Islam and the last is the use of L2 as representing female rights. However, he posited, there is no integrative motivation and gender does not create any discrepancy among the L2 learners. Moreover, he mentioned some factors which demotivate L2 students in Pakistan. These are the teacher's attitude and his teaching method, L2 anxiety, low confidence, classroom facilities & environment. He suggests that the L2 syllabus and L2 evaluation should be related to L2 learner's interests. Therefore, it has been suggested that teachers must focus on attitudinal, situational and self-related factors to keep their students motivated for a long time process of L2 learning. They can enhance L2 motivation by making learning process enjoyable; by using materials from different parts of the world and providing information about the world; by developing possible or future images for students- an ideal or ought-to self-image; and by focusing on short term as well long term material benefits of learning. Thus, it can be said that the L2 Motivational Self System has shown its effectiveness in the context of Pakistan quite sufficiently motivating L2 students of Pakistan.

However, this construct also falls short of theoretical and implicational considerations as it has not been investigated in-depth on all the levels of education. For instance, Islam (2013), Nawaz et al. (2015) and Ali (2016) collected the data from the university students. Moreover, it has not been implemented in the educational context. Therefore, the current study suggests a more in-depth study including elementary and lower secondary L2 students for the collection of the data.

External factors influencing L2 motivation in Pakistan:
Some less unexplored external factors influencing L2 motivation in Pakistan are the threat of failure, the loss of self-respect, inferiority complex, peers, the parents and family pressure. Especially, the threat of failure and the parents & family pressure are substantial preventive factors in the context of Pakistan. For example, the loss of self-respect, personal fear, inferiority complex, and social pressure actively force them to learn English (Yaqoob, Ahmed & Arshad, 2014). L2 learners in Pakistan are also afraid of damaging their family reputation. In Asian countries, there is a robust joint family system. Parents and other family members have pressure on learners. This active family set up has some pressure on students. They force them to learn a second language. As, Lockwood et al. (2005) maintained that the influence of the family and future related fears of L2 learners may play a vital role in developing a positive attitude of L2 learners. Further, other external factors in L2 motivation that have never been explored are the nature and amount of feedback, the nature and amount of

appropriate praise/punishment, the local education system, cultural norms, societal expectations & attitude, conflicting interests. Unfortunately, there is a lack of resaerch regarding the use of motivational strategies in the ESL classrooms. As, Nadeem et al. (2020) has stressed that the ESL teachers in Pakistan need to use some motivational strategies in their classroom in order to develop learning environment and promote learner's autonomy.

Internal factors influencing L2 motivation in Pakistan:
Some unexplored internal factors also affect the L2 motivation of Pakistani students. These are intrinsic motivation, self-attribution, self-efficacy, the expectancy of success, feeling of satisfaction, interest in the course, the optimal degree of challenge, personal relevance, the intrinsic value attributed to the activity, feeling of competence, personal judgments of failure & success and learners helplessness.

From the above discussion, it can be understood that no single factor predicts L2 learning motivation for the target population. Almost all the factors work interconnected to motivate L2 learners in Pakistan (Shahbaz & Liu, 2012). Their motivation for learning L2 is influenced by various geopolitical and socio-economic factors (Yaqoob, Ahmed & Arshad, 2014). Therefore, the future researchers should conduct L2 motivation in Pakistan with multiple approaches, using larger data from all the stratum of social life along with internal & external, classroom situated and context situated factors

Conclusion:

This paper shows that only three models socio-educational model, willingness to communicate in L2 and the L2 motivational self-system have been explored and validated in the context of Pakistan. Instrumental & integrative motivation, and the Ideal L2 and the Ought to Self are explored more. And, willingness to communicate has been investigated with other factors; L2 anxiety and self-perceived communicative competence. There are very little researches that mainly focus on the internal & external factors, classroom motivational strategies, and context situated factors. Moreover, the data is collected from a limited sample but the findings are generalized to a fairly large population. It shows a huge gap between theoretical considerations and practical implications of the L2 models in the present context. In other words, L2 motivation has not been studied with other factors; the age of the L2 learners, educational backgrounds, educational level, and educational field. Therefore, this paper suggests conducting more L2 motivational research in Pakistan focusing on motivational strategies used in the L2 classroom. It also recommends involving more sample data including elementary to university L2 students so that theoretical and practical considerations of the L2 studies may be satisfied. Finally, it implies that L2 motivation is required to be studied with classroom-situated and context-situated factors.

References:

Ali, M. (2016). Motivations and attitudes towards learning English in Pakistan: a mixed-methods study of urban-rural postgraduate learners' motivations and attitudes towards studying English at a public university in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province (Doctoral dissertation, University of Portsmouth).

Ali, I., & Ahmed, K. (2019). A Study of the ESL Students' Motivational Orientations: A Case of Public and Private Schools. European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences, 8(1), pp-188.

Bukhari, S. F., Cheng, X., & Khan, S. A. (2015). Willingness to Communicate in English as a Second Language: A Case Study of Pakistani Undergraduates. Journal of Education and Practice, 6(29), 39-44.

Ifra Anam, D., Rizwan, A., Ali, H., & Mughal, W. Factors Affecting the Motivation Level of Undergraduate ESL Learners at University of Sargodha, Pakistan. www. mjltm. com info@ mjltm. org, 64.

Dörnyei, Z. (2009). The L2 Motivational Self System. In Z. & E. Ushioda (Eds.), Motivation, language identity and the L2 self (pp. 9-42). Bristol: Multilingual Matters.

Gardner, R.C. (1985). Social psychology and second language learning: The role of attitudes and motivation. London: Edward Arnold Limited.

Ghani, M. (2003). Language learning strategies employed by L2 learners. Journal of Research (Faculty of Languages & Islamic Studies), 4, 31-36.

Ghani, M., & Azhar, S. W. (2017). Effect of Motivation, Willingness to Communicate (WTC), Self Perceived Communicative Competence (SPCC) and L2 Anxiety on the Frequency of Use of English as L2. Journal of Educational Research (1027-9776), 20(1).

Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. A. (1991). Foreign language classroom anxiety. In E. K. Horwitz & D. J. Young (Eds.), Language anxiety: From theory and research to classroom implications (pp. 27-36). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Islam, M., Lamb, M., & Chambers, G. (2013). The L2 Motivational Self System and National Interest: A Pakistani perspective. System, 41(2), 231–244. doi:10.1016/j.system.2013.01.025

Jabeen, F., Mahmood, M. A. & Rashed, S.(2011). An Attitudinal Study of Pakistani English. Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business, 3, 109 - 119.

Khalid, A. (2016). A study of the attitudes and motivational orientations of Pakistani learners toward the learning of English as a second language. SAGE Open, 6(3), 2158244016665887.

Khurshid, M. A. (2017). Second Language Motivational Orientations of Undergraduate Students at a Pakistani Public Sector University. Journal of Educational Research (1027-9776), 20(1).

Rosheen Khan, M. (2014). Socio-linguistic Study to Investigate the Factors Affecting L2 Oral Communication at Postgraduate Level in Pakistan. Arab World English Journal, 5(4).

Lockwood, P., Marshaal, T. C. & Sadler, P.(2005). Promoting Success or Preventing Failure: Cultural Differences in Motivation by Positive and Negative Role Models. Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 31, 379-392

MacIntyre, P. D., Clément, R., Dörnyei, Z., & Noels, K. A. (1998). Conceptualizing willingness to communicate in a L2: A situational model of L2 confidence and affiliation. The Modern Language Journal, 82(4), 545-562.

Mc Croskey, J. C. (1984). Communication competence. The elusive construct. In R. N. Bostrom (Ed.) Competence in communication: A multidisciplinary approach, (pp. 259-268). Beverly Hills, CA: SAGE Publications.

Nadeem et al. (2020). Teachers Specific Motivational Strategies used in the L2 context of Sialkot Pakistan. Elementary Education Online, 2020; Vol 19 (Issue 3): pp. 2302-2309 http://ilkogretim-online.org

Nawaz, H., Amin, M., & Tatla, I. A. (2015). Factors Affecting Students' Motivation Level to Learn English as a Second Language in the Pakistani University Context. Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE), 9(2).

Pintrich, P. R. (2002). The role of metacognitive knowledge in learning, teaching, and assessing. Theory into Practice 41(4): 219–225.

Pathan, H., Shahriar, A., & Mari, M. A. (2010). Motivation for learning English in Pakistan. ELF, Annual Research Journal, 12, 75-93.

Rehman, A., Bilal, H., Sheikh, A., Bibi, N., & Nawaz, A. (2014). The role of motivation in learning English language for Pakistani learners. International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 4(1), 254-258.

Shahbaz, M., Khan, M. S., Khan, R. M. I., & Mustafa, G. (2016). Role of self-perceived communication competence and communication apprehension for willingness to communicate in L1 and L2. Journal of Educational and Social Research, 6(1), 158.

Shahbaz, M., & Liu, Y. (2012). Complexity of L2 Motivation in an Asian ESL Setting. Porta Linguarum 18, Junio 2012.

Siming, L. (2015). Factors Leading to Students' Satisfaction in the Higher Learning Institutions. Journal of Education and Practice, 6(31), 114-118.

Spielberger, C. D. (1983). State-trait anxiety inventory for adults.

Tort Calvo, E., & Reeves, A. (2015). Language learning motivation. Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona.

Yaqoob, M., Ahmed, M., & Arshad, M. (2014). Motivation and ESL Learning Self-system in Pakistani Students. Research on Humanities and Social Sciences. ISSN (Paper)2224-5766 ISSN (Online)2225-0484 (Online) Vol.4, No.25, 2014.