

PalArch's Journal of Archaeology
of Egypt / Egyptology

**INDIA-THE UNITED STATES CIVIL NUCLEAR DEAL (2008) :
SECURITY IMPLICATIONS FOR PAKISTAN**

Yunas Khan¹, Prof. Dr. Zahid Anwar²

¹Assistant Professor, Department of Pakistan Studies, Islamia College Peshawar.

²Dean of Social Sciences/Director China Study Centre, University of Peshawar

Yunas Khan , Prof. Dr. Zahid Anwar , India-The United States Civil Nuclear Deal (2008) : Security Implications For Pakistan , Palarch's Journal Of Archaeology Of Egypt/Egyptology 18(8), 3515-3520. ISSN 1567-214x.

Key Words: Pakistan, India, United States, Pakistan, Civil Nuclear Deal, Nuclear Suppliers Group, Nuclear Proliferation Treaty, Uranium, Low Enriched Uranium.

Abstract:

This paper will try to analyze the India – United States Civil Nuclear Deal which shows the temperateness in the strategic partnership between the oldest and the largest democracies. Although the zeal of the deal has faded with the passage of time and the careless attitude of President Donald Trump towards India. But the fact remains that the significance of this deal lies in American recognition of India as a de-jure nuclear power by bypassing the NPT and NSG and the global nuclear non-proliferation regimes. This deal has paved the way of India in accomplishing mastery in the field of the art of the state nuclear technology. In 2005 when President Bush and Manmohan Singh - Prime Minister of India announced a broader state of initiatives as part of the new commitment to comprehensive bilateral relations. Among these, India –The United States Civil Nuclear Deal /the Civil Nuclear Cooperation Agreement or the 123 Agreement has gathered the greatest consideration. Both partners shared three objectives in undertaking this civil nuclear initiative; to boost the Indian economy and ensure energy security, to remove the core differences between India and the US, to strengthen the global non-proliferation regime. This undue nuclear incentive to India will further trigger the continuing arms race in war-torn South Asia and Pakistan's concerns are not unsubstantiated.

Introduction

The transformation of the “estranged” democracies of the pre-Cold War era into “engaged democracies” after the War, coupled with the breakup of the Union of Soviet Socialist

Republics, explains the turbulent history of relations between India and the United States. The US-Pakistan alliance and the friendly relations between India and the Soviet Union were the two significant factors that undermined the relationship between the US and India. After the Cold War, however, India and the US strengthened their bilateral relations. The terrorist attacks on 11 September 2001 proved instrumental in closing the gap between the world's largest and oldest democracies. Even though US President Bill Clinton rediscovered India during his visit in 2000, it was President George W. Bush who transformed the relationship between the two countries, implementing the Next Steps in Strategic Partnership (NSSP). President Bush also paved the way for the United States-India Civil Nuclear Agreement, the most important aspect of the strategic partnership between both countries. The terms of the agreement call for joint army training, the transfer of twin use technology, military cooperation, and other points. The joint incentives for New Delhi and Washington now include trade and investment, the protection of marine trade, cyber security, intelligence sharing, intellectual property rights, horticulture, health, advanced atomic science education, and technology.

India obtained the US's favor by means of the NSG's waiver to carry out nuclear trade with the US and other major nuclear powers. The United States-India Civil Nuclear Agreement took three years to come to fruition due to staunch opposition in both India and the US (Bhonsle, Parkash, & Gupta, 2009). The agreement has widely disturbed global non-proliferation efforts. According to Mark Hibbs, this deal has undermined the global non-proliferation efforts and intensified the fears of atomic autarky in the region (Hibbs, 2010). The deal will undermine endeavours to anticipate the alleged rogue countries like the Iran and the North Korea from misusing atomic weaponries and will add to an atomic competition in South Asia (Bajoria & Pan, 2010).

Also, there is no other strong organization to restrict Indian atomic program through this arrangement as according to the Henry Sokolski of the Non-Proliferation Policy Education Center, "We are transferring or permitting other countries to transfer, atomic fuel to India, just as, yellow cakes and LEU which will permit Indian domestic uranium to be exclusively used to make more bombs than they could by their own. Jaspal's perspective is that the presentation of India-explicit amendments has eroded the international non-proliferation regime and has created environment for a nuclear arms race in South Asia (Jaspal, 2008).

Majority of the security experts acknowledge that the South Asian nuclear race is further exploded by India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal signed in October 2008 .Devin T. Hagerty also has pointed out that Indian mission for more advanced nuclear and the nuclear related technologies stems, in greater measure from, her ostensible drive to achieve qualitative equality with her powerful neighbor- China in the nuclear realm; its most immediate effect will be, to deepen the India-Pakistan nuclear competition(Hagerty,2019) .Cooperation between India and the US, particularly within the nuclear and space sectors, will increase the asymmetry in the conventional and non- conventional balance of power between two South Asian neighbors in arms. Critics of the India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal have assessed that straightforwardly this arrangement will fuel the Indian atomic program .The escape clauses in 123 Agreement and India Specific IAEA safeguards agreement will allow India to use the imported fissile material for making nuclear weapons. According to Cheema two notable non-proliferation experts –Daryl G. Kimball –the Executive Director of the Arms Control Association and Jayantha Dhanapala–former United Nations Under Secretary have also slated the deal for igniting nuclear arms race in the region. Cheema has referred to another nuclear expert- Michael Krepon according to him the India-United States Nuclear deal might give a stimulus to India to resume nuclear

testing and if it did so, will increase her nuclear arsenal. The learned author has explained that Dr. Manmohan Singh confirmed in the Indian Parliament, that there was nothing in the deal to prevent India from further nuclear testing if so warranted by national interests (Cheema, 2010).

Featuring the local ramifications of the atomic arrangement for Pakistan, Adil Sultan wrote that if India was not stopped to divert the fissile material for peaceful uses towards nuclear weapons will result in a nuclear competition and the subsequent destabilization of the region .(Sultan, 2007). Another notable strategic expert- Rizwana Abbasi has noted that today India enjoys a technological edge over many states in the region as it has got an easy access to a global nuclear market in the background of the Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG) waiver (Abbasi, 2019). The CLND would permit the United States to provide India with the fuel for civilian power generators if misused will lead to a nuclear race .The talks for the civil nuclear deal, surprisingly, had been conducted in total confidentiality (Pressler, 2017).

The United States has opened all military and technology doors to India, and forced Israel, Australia, France, Canada, the United Kingdom and other allies to follow suit. For the last eight years, India has been the world's largest arms importer from the United States, procuring over \$100 billion of weapons per annum, 75 per cent of that total is deployed against Pakistan (Akram, 2016). India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal will improve the Indian atomic program quantitatively, as well as qualitatively. Thus, India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal is by and large to compromise the national security of Pakistan. This deal will change the security situation in South Asia (Mirza, 2015).

Nuclear Weapons and Deterrence Stability in South Asia(2019) by Devin T. Hagerty explained that both India and Pakistan had promised to remain peaceful and maintain minimum nuclear deterrence just to avoid a full-fledged war and save the scarce financial resources but now it seems there is a tough arms race going on between them.

Neighbors in Arms (2018) by Senator Larry Pressler addressed the issues like, history and origin of nuclear weapon in South Asia, challenges to nuclear non-proliferation and lessons learnt from these risky developments. In part 6 the Senator has discussed the India- the US Civil Nuclear Deal, which according to him, was a dealt with as 'dead secret' by both the countries. He has also explained the consequences of this deal for South Asia in general and Pakistan, in particular. He has anticipated a nuclear arms race in South Asia because of this deal.

Confronting the Bomb: Pakistani and Indian Scientists Speak Out(2013) by Parvez Hoodhboy is a joint venture of Pakistani and Indian scientists, which has explored banned but urgent nuclear issues between two nuclear neighbors. The book starts with the nuclearization of India in 1974. Hoodhboy argued that the internal challenges being faced by nuclear bomb in Pakistan are quite high. These scientists have explored the technical issues related to a nuclear bomb. In two essays the experts have talked about the viability of electricity generation through nuclear means and has rejected this as a feasible option for the Indian Sub-Continent on technical grounds.

Indian Nuclear Deterrence: Its Evolution, Development and Implications for South Asian Security (2010) by Dr. Zafar Iqbal Cheema. In this book India-United States' CLND has been criticized for igniting an arms race in South Asia. The book evaluates the changing aspects of the nuclear deterrence of India, Indian nuclear doctrine and its repercussions for South Asian security. This book is comprehensive than any other book on this subject in

terms of duration it covers- 1947-2011, as well as, the number of the issues covered. “Indian Nuclear Deterrence” is also the first book written on this topic from Pakistani perspective.

Indo-U.S. Civil Nuclear Deal(2006) by Rahul K. Bhonsle, Ved Prakash & K.R. Gupta .These scholars declared the India-the United States Civil Nuclear Deal is a historical event for India’s tacit entry into the elite nuclear club .The authors contended that Pakistan and China saw this development detrimental to their strategic interests while on the other hand France, Australia, Britain and Germany acknowledging the emergence of India on the international stage has welcomed it .This book contains details of the deal and its impacts on South Asia and the possible response from Pakistan.

Zafar Nawaz Jaspal in an article , the “ Indo-US Nuclear Deal: Altering Global Nuclear Order “ published in Islamabad Strategic Studies Institute (2014) has written a comprehensive and thought provoking paper on India- the US Civil Deal ,where the author has reconnoitered the consequences of the deal for Pakistan, South Asia and the world. He is of the opinion that this deal will further increase the Indian nuclear capabilities and Pakistan will be forced to match .In this arms race Pakistan will be at a disadvantageous position and will have three options to either cap, roll back or surrender its nuclear program.

Council on Foreign Relations’ report on, “The U.S.-India Nuclear Deal” (2010) by Jayshree Bajoria and Esther Pan reported that the deal will help improve India and the US relations but at the cost of NPT ,FMCT and NSG .The authors held opinion that Pakistan was feeling insecure and will react, therefore , it will ignite nuclear arms race in the region, as it is a unique deal given to India.

Statement of the Problem

In this research history of the India’s and Pakistan’s nuclearization and the attitude of the United States towards them during the Cold War era, will be traced back till India’s first Indian nuclear detonations in 1974.It was India which introduced the ultimate weapon the , ‘nuclear bomb’ in the troubled politics of South Asia not Pakistan. Indian nuclear bomb threatened Pakistan’s security. Pakistan nuclear program was only defensive in nature. In the post -Cold War era, the policy of the United States took a U-turn and tilt towards India and now it has signed Civil Nuclear Deal with India in 2008.This deal is a game changer in the bi-lateral relations of India and the United States, but a challenge for Pakistan .The proposed research will analyze the above mentioned dimensions of the issue.

Aims and Objectives

1. To explore the dynamics and nature of the nuclear arms race in South Asia.
2. To explicate the features and context of India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal.
3. To discuss the causes of the United States nuclear policy shift towards India.
4. To highlight the implications of India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal for the security of Pakistan.

Research Questions

1. What are the dynamics of nuclearization of South Asia?
2. What are the features of India- the United States Civil Nuclear Deal?
3. What is the real motive behind India-the United States Civil Nuclear Deal?
4. Why has the US shifted her nuclear policy towards India?
5. How can the India-the United States Civil Nuclear Deal impact the security of Pakistan?

Research Methodology

This research is qualitative and analytical in nature in which primary, as well as, secondary sources of data have been used. A convenient sampling method is followed in this research. For collection of primary data interviews were conducted with five prominent security analysts from Strategic Plans Division (SPD) Islamabad and Islamabad Policy Research Institute (IPRI), South Asian Strategic Stability Institute (SASSI) and other think tanks in Pakistan, five military officers, ten academicians from National Defence University Islamabad and different other universities. Ten eminent journalists related to the field of security and defence are interviewed. Research journals issued by famous think tanks like IPRI, SASSI etc are referred to. Research reports issued by famous research organizations are used. Five foreign security analysts from the United States, five from India and five from the United Kingdom are also accessed via internet.

Theoretical Framework

The doctrine of nuclear deterrence by Bernard Bordie in his famous book entitled “the Absolute Weapon: Atomic power and the World Order, published in 1946 is more relevant a theory to the India-Pakistan situation. Bordie opined that the usefulness of atomic bomb was not in its deployment but in the threat of its deployment. According to this strategy, threat of mutual destruction keeps a powerful country away from attacking a small and weak country. Nuclear experts agreed that the crises like the Kargil War (1999), Attack on Indian Parliament (2001), Mumbai attack (2008), the Uri’s Accident (2016), the Pulwama incident and the resultant so called Indian Surgical Strikes (2019) in Azad Kashmir have shown that nuclear deterrence has worked and played an effective role in the de-escalation of tension between India and Pakistan. Bernard Bordie’s theory of nuclear deterrence has enough relevance to India-Pakistan situation.

Conclusion

It is concluded that the India-US Civil Nuclear Deal grasps damaging security implications for South Asia in general, and Pakistan in particular, as Pakistan is the direct target of the Indian nuclear program. In the given circumstances according to experts two options are available to Pakistan; one group advocates to continue with this mad nuclear race and the other urges to quit it altogether, but both of them are not advisable options for Pakistan. Although it is Pakistan’s top priority but it cannot manage to pay for the exorbitant costs of nuclear program to continue with this wild race because of ramshackle economy nor it can abandon it totally to risk its security. Pakistan should take the middle course of minimum credible nuclear deterrence, in order to safeguard national security as well as, to evade economic bankruptcy to steer clear of this muddle.

References

- Abbasi, R. (The Express Tribune, October 3, 2019). India’s thermonuclear bomb.
- Akram, M. (2016). The Indo-US alliance and its implications for Pakistan, The Daily Dawn.
- Bajoria, J., & Pan, E. (2010). The U.S.-India Nuclear Deal. Retrieved October 19, 2019, from :<http://www.cfr.org/india/us-india-nuclear-deal/p9663>
- Bhonsle, R., Ved, P. & Gupta, K.R. (2009). Indo-US Civil Nuclear Deal, New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers and Distributors (p) LTD.

Cheema,Z.I.(2010)Indian nuclear deterrence. Its evolution, development and implications for South Asian security. Karachi:Oxford University Press.

Hagerty, D. T. (2019). Nuclear Weapons and Deterrence Stability in South Asia: Springer.

Hibbs, M. (2010). Moving Forward on the U.S.-India Nuclear Deal. Retrieved October 18, 2019, from <http://www.carnegieendowment.org/2010/04/05/moving-forward-on-u.s.-indianuclear-deal/25yl>

Jaspal, Z. N. (2008). Indo-US nuclear deal: altering global nuclear order'. Strategic Studies, 27(2-3), 18-38.

Kimball, G.D.(October 1 ,2008).Statement of Daryl G. Kimball, Arms Control Association Executive Director, on the U.S.-Indian Agreement for Nuclear Cooperation. Retrieved from <https://www.armscontrol.org/pressroom/2008-10/statement-daryl-g-kimball-arms-control-association-executive-director-us-indian>

Mirza, A. M. (2015). Indo-US strategic partnership & its implications on regional security. Retrieved October 20, 2019, from <https://foreignpolicynews.org/2015/04/29/indo-usstrategic-partnership-its-implications-on-regional-security/>

Pressler, L. (2017). Neighbours in Arms: An American Senator's Quest for Disarmament in a Nuclear Subcontinent: Penguin Random House India Private Limited.

Sultan,A.(2007).Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies. Retrieved April 12, 2015, from http://www.ipcs.org/pdf_file/news_archive/aug_07_indiaexternal.pdf